Gov't

Journal of Administration Overseas

DARTMOUTH COLLEGE
DEC 4 1973
LIBRARY

Volume XII/Number 4/October 1973

Price 52½p quarterly net; annual subscription including postage £1.50

INCLUDING

Local Administration in Botswana
by William Tordoff

Administration and Politics in Western Malaysia
by J. H. Beaglehole

Financing Panchayati Raj in Andhra Pradesh
by K. S. Subrahmanyam

BOOK REVIEWS
by Dr. Van Arkadie, R. E. Wraith, Percy Selwyn, Sir Robert Fowler, Professor W. J. M. Mackenzie, David Taylor, A. C. Reid, Mrs. C. F. Swaisland

Published for the Foreign and Commonwealth Office, Overseas Development Administration

HER MAJESTY'S STATIONERY OFFICE

This *Journal* is edited in the Social Affairs Department of the Foreign and Commonwealth Office Overseas Development Administration. It aims at providing a medium for the exchange of information about administration at all levels, whether in local government or in the organisation of central departments. It also covers land tenure. Nothing in the *Journal* should be read as necessarily representing official views or policy unless this is specifically stated. The responsibility for facts and opinions expressed in signed articles rests with the authors.

NOTES TO CONTRIBUTORS

Articles for publication in the *Journal* from serving officers and others with knowledge and experience in the field covered by the *Journal* are welcome and should be addressed to the Editor, Social Affairs Department, Foreign and Commonwealth Office, Overseas Development Administration, Eland House, Stag Place, Victoria, London SW1E 5DH.

Books for review, reports and communications for the Editor should be similarly addressed.

Twenty off-prints are supplied free of charge on request to contributors whose articles are published. Requests for off-prints should be made at the time articles are submitted. Off-prints in excess of twenty are charged for at a rate relative to the length of the article.

Orders and subscriptions should be sent to Her Majesty's Stationery Office at the addresses given below.

The Government does not accept responsibility for any of the private or trade advertisements included in this publication

Published by

HER MAJESTY'S STATIONERY OFFICE

49 High Holborn, London WC1V 6HB

13a Castle St., Edinburgh EH2 3AR 109 St Mary St., Cardiff CF1 1JW

Brazennose St., Manchester M60 8AS 50 Fairfax St., Bristol BS1 3DE

258 Broad St., Birmingham B1 2HE 80 Chichester St., Belfast BT1 4JY

or through booksellers

Price 30p net, annual subscription including postage, £1.50

© *Crown copyright* 1973

Journal of Administration Overseas

Volume XII/Number 4/October 1973

Contents

Editor's Notes 171

Local Administration in Botswana – Part 1 172
by William Tordoff

The District: Some Aspects of Administration and Politics in Malaysia
by J. H. Beaglehole 184

Financing Panchayati Raj in Andhra Pradesh
by K. S. Subrahamanayam 199

Land Tenure and Size of Holdings – towards a new strategy for economic studies in tenancy farming in the Gezira Scheme
by Taha El Jack Taha 211

The Effectiveness of Consultants in the Developing World
by John Sargent 219

Quarterly Notes: 225
East African Community Management Institute
Law as an Instrument of Reform
Disaster Relief by Satellite
Local Government substitute for Ombudsman

Book Reviews 229

Book Notes 245

Editor's Notes

In this number, an examination is made of district administration in two widely differing countries in each of which, in the post-independence era, the district officer has retained a strong and authoritative position. Professor Tordoff's study is of Botswana – the dry, arid cattle country of Southern Africa, now awakening with the prospects of mineral wealth to help offset the dire consequences of far too frequent droughts. Botswana, a cattle country where 12 per cent of the population owns 60 per cent of the stock; where the gap between rich and poor pervades the rural sector; where erstwhile strong traditional authorities face the catalytic problems of modern changes, and look askance at the development of district councils and at Land Boards now empowered to allocate holdings – previously a Chiefly right.

Dr. Beaglehole describes the administrator's role in the Malaysian State of Kelantin where the district officer has retained much of his status and authority since independence. There has been pressure for radical reform, but the author believes that the position of the DO in Western Malaysia is likely to be retained and may even be strengthened – interestingly, for political if not for administrative reasons.

The management of a major agricultural undertaking is a most important facet of field administration. Mr. Taha, writing from his own practical experience with the Sudan Gezira Board, examines modern developments and the introduction of new strategies to meet the current requirements of the Gezira Scheme. These involve an integrated approach to planning and programming for the modification of existing land tenure, which the author confidently believes will lead to enhanced prosperity for this notable enterprise.

From the problems of administration we turn to those of public finance – the *sine qua non* for all public administration. Mr. Subrahamanayam provides a broad picture of how the rural local authorities in the Indian State of Andhra Pradesh are financed. The imposition and collection of taxes is no rapid road to popularity; but it is clearly shown here that there is urgent need for *Panchayati Raj* bodies to mobilise fully the resources available to them, to seek new sources of revenue as well; and for the State government to provide greater material and moral support. Otherwise the services and capital works needed to raise the living standards of the rural masses will not be provided; nor will the autonomy and viability of the local authorities be assured.

Finally, John Sargent contributes a succinct note on the use, by developing countries, of external consultancy services to provide particular specialised skills where these are at present lacking locally. It is to be hoped that both sides to such arrangements will note the emphasis placed on the follow-up visit for evaluation purposes. This, it will surely be agreed, is the only way to determine whether the service provided has really proved effective.

Local Administration in Botswana - Part 1

Dr Tordoff is Professor of Government at Manchester University. He visited Botswana in January 1970 as a member of a Local Government Study Group and again in July-August 1972 on a grant from the Social Science Research Council. He is deeply indebted to the Botswana Government for the generous research facilities made available to him.

By WILLIAM TORDOFF

THE basic facts about Botswana are well known. The former High Commission territory of Bechuanaland achieved independence in September 1966 under the shadow of its powerful neighbour, the Republic of South Africa, to which it is linked by a Customs Agreement, revised in 1969[1]. It is a poor country with a small, predominantly Setswana-speaking population (some 650,000), divided into eight main tribes – the Bamangwato, the Batawana, the Bakgatla, the Bakwena, the Bangwaketse, the Bamalete, the Barolong and the Batlokwa. Of the non-Setswana-speaking minorities, the Bakalanga have been most prominent in the modern period. The population is unevenly distributed throughout a large area (220,000 sq. miles), with more than 80 per cent of the people living astride the railway line which runs from north to south in the eastern part of the country. Botswana is predominantly rural, with only some 50,000 people resident in the three main towns of Francistown, Lobatse and Gaborone, the capital. This rural predominance will continue despite the growth of new mining centres at Orapa (diamonds) and Selebi-Pikwe (copper-nickel), both in the Central District. The national motto, *pula* (rain), indicates that lack of water is a national problem – sometimes, as in the drought years of the mid-1960s, a very acute one, and the arid climate makes cattle rearing more profitable than arable farming in most parts of the country.

"Every Motswana owns some cattle". So, at least, it seems on a public holiday when Ministers and civil servants alike leave Gaborone and the other towns and head for their often distant cattle-posts. But such a statement is not correct. The facts are that 12 per cent of Botswana's farming population owns 60 per cent of the cattle. Of those who do own cattle, 60 per cent have herds of 40 or less; 23 per cent of the people own no cattle at all[2]. Moreover, a recent agricultural survey in the Shoshong area of the Central District suggests that the traditional practice of *mafisa*, whereby one man looks after another man's cattle, may be less important as a means for the "smallest man" to build up his herd than is often assumed[3]. Not only there-

[1] See P. M. Landell-Mills, "The 1969 Southern Customs Union Agreement", *The Journal of Modern African Studies* (1971), Vol. 9, No 2, pp. 263-81.

[2] "'A People's Progress": Speech by President Sir Seretse Khama, Opening the Third Session of the Second Parliament of Botswana, 3 December 1971 (Gaborone: Government Printer, December 1971), p. 11.

[3] The "smallest man" is someone who may well have difficulty in organising a cattle-post of his own. Lucy Syson, "Income Expenditure and Wealth in the Shoshong Area", Technical Note No. 31, UNDP (Special Fund), April 1972, mimeo., pp. 11-12.

fore is there a widening gap in Botswana between those who live in the towns and those who live in the rural areas[4], there is also marked inequality within the rural sector.

Probably, some inequality has always existed. It may be assumed that under the traditional system, which gave every farmer the right to claim from his Chief sufficient land to maintain himself and his family, one family worked harder and prospered more than another. But the problem has increased immeasurably in recent years and intense pressure upon the land has led to an acute shortage in the Eastern tribal areas. The trend has been for a few wealthy and influential members of the community to acquire rights over very large areas to the exclusion of less prosperous families. If this trend continues unchecked, a situation might be created in which "most of the land is owned or allocated to a relatively few rich people and a landless class is thus created"[5]. Among this class might be many discontented young men, educated at least to the primary school level. At present, the stark facts are that only about three out of every ten primary school-leavers in Botswana can hope either to find salaried jobs within the country or to obtain further training or education. The remainder must find employment in the rural economy or enlist for work in South Africa[6]. The Botswana Democratic Party (BDP) Government, which is committed to the achievement of social justice, has pledged itself to prevent a landless class emerging. It has instituted brigade training[7] both to provide a low-cost answer to Botswana's needs for skilled artisans and to help solve the growing problem of youth unemployment. It has also stated that the agricultural future of Botswana does not depend on opening up virgin lands in the West, South-West, and North: "the most pressing problem . . . is how to deal with the grossly abused settled areas concentrated mainly in tribal land in the East"[8].

The allocation of tribal land was a power traditionally vested in the Chiefs who retained extensive powers under the original Order-in-Council of 1885 (creating the Bechuanaland Protectorate) and subsequent legislation. Each of the eight principal tribes had its own Chief who worked through subordinate officials – sub-chiefs, chief's representatives, and village/ward headmen – in controlling all aspects of tribal life with a minimum of interference from the British Administration. Chiefly rule was consolidated when

---

[4]See "National Policy on Incomes, Employment, Prices and Profits", Government Paper No. 2 (Gaborone: Government Printer, March 1972), pp. 1-11.

[5]Sir Seretse Khama, "Rural Development", Address to a Conference on Rural Development, 11 July 1970, in *Development in Botswana* (Gaborone: Government Printer, n.d.), p. 20.

[6]Ministry of Local Government and Lands" files; Q. K. J. Masire, "A developing society": Vice-President's Address to 9th Annual BDP Conference, Molepolole, 29 May 1970, in *Development in Botswana*, *op. cit.* p. 5.

[7]Following successful experiments undertaken by Patrick van Rensburg at Swaneng Hill School outside Serowe the Government introduced its own scheme of vocational training. Brigades were established to teach young men (and sometimes women) a particular skill which might be brick-laying (hence a Builders' Brigade), carpentry, shoe-making, or spinning and weaving, in the hope that these young men would in turn instruct the people when they returned to their villages. Responsibility for brigade training was vested in the Department of Community Development.

[8]"A People's Progress", *op. cit.* p. 10.

Chiefs represented their tribes on a central consultative body – the Native Advisory Council, created in 1920[9].

Sir Alan Pim's report to the British Government on the financial and economic position of Bechuanaland (1933) pointed the way to change. The Native Administration Proclamation, 1934, was the first of a series of measures which sought to apply the principles of indirect rule to Bechuanaland through the establishment of a council for each tribal area under a Chief, and the institution of native tribunals and treasuries. New proclamations, issued in 1943, made changes welcome to the Chiefs: in particular the *kgotla*, the traditional tribal meeting, was recognised in place of the tribal council[10]. The latter body, however, was resurrected under the African Administration Proclamation of 1956, with the Chief as chairman. The emphasis therefore shifted from Chief as "sole Native Authority" to Chief-in-Council. At the same time, subordinate bodies, called district councils, were established within each sub-division of the tribal area and were presided over by the local headmen; they contained both members nominated by him and members elected by the people in *kgotla*. In this way, a narrow democratic wedge was inserted into a local government structure that revolved round the Chief.

As Bechuanaland moved towards independence in the early 1960s, further changes in local government were planned. A Local Government Commission, set up in 1963, recommended a system of district councils of which the majority of members were to be elected on the basis of universal adult suffrage. The Commission's principal recommendations were accepted and were implemented during 1965 by the Local Government (District Councils) Law and the Local Government Tax Law. Provision for the office of Chief was also made in the Chieftainship Ordinance. The effect of these laws was to reduce considerably the legal powers of the Chiefs in favour of predominantly elected bodies. Both the latter and the Tribal Administration, over which the Chiefs continued to preside, were made directly responsible to the Ministry of Local Government and Lands, represented in the field by district commissioners and their staff. Thus, the modified system of indirect rule, which had operated between 1957 and 1964, gave way to a three-pronged structure made up of district councils, tribal administration, and a supervisory district administration.

THE FRAMEWORK ESTABLISHED UNDER THE 1965 ORDINANCES.

1. *District Councils*[11]

The Local Government (District Councils) Law (No. 11 of 1965) established nine district councils. No council was set up in Chobe District[12], but

[9]The title of this Council was changed to the African Advisory Council in 1940 and to the African Council in 1951. In the latter year a Joint Advisory Council, representative of African and European interests, was created.

[10]Details of this early period are given in Part V of Lord Hailey's *Native Administration in the British African Territories* (London: HMSO, 1953).

[11]These articles concentrate on administration in the rural areas, and urban local government is only discussed marginally. There are three town councils: Gaborone, Francistown and Lobatse; they were established in April 1966 under revised Town Council Regulations. Selebi-Pikwe, the new mining centre, is constituted as a township authority.

[12]The people of this district are represented on the North West District Council, based on Maun.

otherwise the area of jurisdiction of the district council coincided roughly with that of the administrative district. Councils varied enormously in terms of their geographical size and population, ranging from the council for the huge and densely populated Central District at one end of the scale to that for the small South East District at the other[13]. With the exception of Ghanzi District Council, which includes a predominantly white farming bloc and adjacent state lands inhabited on a non-tribal basis, the district council areas correspond to the eight main tribal divisions of Botswana. Thus, the area of the Central District Council corresponds almost exactly to the Bamangwato Tribal Area. (If it had not done so two or three administrative districts, with a corresponding number of district councils, might have been carved out of the Central District in 1965; such a step would have administrative advantages[14] and is still being considered. Existing arrangements – which have been strongly criticised in the National Assembly, include the posting of district officers to out-stations and, for the District Council, the devolution of revenue collection and health services from Serowe.) The councils also differ vastly in resources, the Central District Council being particularly well endowed[15]. The present imbalance between this Council and the others would have increased immeasurably if the BDP Government had not acquired for the State, control of the rich mineral deposits found within the Council area at Orapa and Selebi-Pikwe. As President Sir Seretse Khama (who is still recognised unofficially by the Bamangwato as their Chief)[16] explained at Kanye, the headquarters of the Southern District, the Government proposed to use the mineral wealth of the Central District to develop the country as a whole[17].

The composition of district councils and the manner of electing their members was laid down in the Order establishing each council. Today, the size of the councils varies from a total of 38 in the Central District to 12 in Ghanzi and North-Eastern Districts; there is variation, too, in the proportion of nominated to elected members. Candidates for election to the councils must, like voters, be citizens of Botswana, reside in the council area, and be 21 years of age or over; they hold office for three years. Each

---

[13]Central: 56,070 sq. miles and 242,000 people; South East: 785 sq. miles and 23,400. Kgalagadi and Ghanzi Districts are large in area, but each has a (1971) estimated population of only 19,400. *Town and District Councils: Estimates of Revenue and Expenditure*, 1972 (Gaborone: Government Printer, n.d.) p. 2.

[14]Administratively, the Central District is at present "disjointed", to use the expression of a senior officer in the District. While District Administration covers the whole district, certain departments divide the latter into areas, of which some fall into other administrative districts. Thus, Bokalaka and Rakops are administered from Serowe, but for agricultural purposes the first comes under Francistown (North East District) and the second under Maun (North West District).

[15]Income (1972, excluding grants): Central District Council – R750,850; all district and Town Councils (including Central District Council) – R2,479,949. *Town & District Councils: Estimates of Revenue and Expenditure*, 1972, *op. cit.*, p. 3.

[16]See Edwin S. Munger, *Bechuanaland: Pan-African Outpost or Bantu Homeland* (London: Oxford University Press, 1965), pp. 13-16.

[17]Sir Seretse Khama, "Development, democracy and unity", Speech at Kanye, 17 June 1970, in *Development in Botswana*, *op. cit.*, p. 12.

council elects its own chairman and vice-chairman, except when the President appoints a chairman *ex officio* (initially, the Chiefs were so appointed) or by name.

Elections for district and town councils were held at the same time as parliamentary elections in 1966 and 1969. They were contested on party lines and the BDP secured a working majority on each council either as a result of the voting or through nomination by the Minister of Local Government and Lands[18]. The minister's use of his nominating power to obtain a majority for the governing party or to strengthen that majority was bitterly resented by the opposition parties.

District councils have a number of mandatory functions, easily the most important is responsibility for providing primary education, as prescribed by the Education Law of 1966[19]. Councils are required to collect local tax[20], which today takes the form of a graduated personal tax ranging from a minimum of R3 p.a. to a maximum of R48. (This taxation system, which is based on residence, is in need of critical re-evaluation. A man from Kgatleng District who works for the Public Works Department in Gaborone, pays personal tax to the Gaborone Town Council, but nothing at all to the Kgatleng District Council, where his wife lives and his children go to school. Again, a civil servant or politician living in Gaborone or another urban centre may pay no tax to the local authority within whose area he keeps a large herd of cattle). Councils are also required to collect trade licensing fees, and to control the manufacture and sale of traditional beer. Permissive functions include the provision of sanitary services and water supplies, the construction and maintenance of public roads, and the establishment of markets. Councils have adopted model by-laws drawn up by the Ministry of Local Government and Lands; they can also make their own by-laws, which are subject to the Minister's approval.

In carrying out these functions, councils work through committees but cannot confer on them the power to make by-laws or to raise money. Every council has to appoint a finance committee and an education committee; the district education officer is normally invited to attend meetings of the latter. A council may appoint such other committees as it sees fit and most councils have established staff, health and works, licensing, and community and economic development committees; the tendency has perhaps been for the smaller councils to set up more committees than they really need. Committees have the power of co-option, though insufficient use is made of this power to obtain advice – for example, from government officers or prominent members of the local community. The main committees meet monthly and are closely controlled by leading BDP councillors; they report to quarterly meetings of the district council.

---

[18]As a result of the 1969 elections, the BDP secured a majority in 6 district councils, the same number of seats as the opposition in 3 others (1 district council and 2 town councils), and was outnumbered in the North East District Council and the Francistown Town Council by the Botswana People's Party. *Town and District Councils: Estimates of Revenue and Expenditure, 1972, op. cit. passim.*

[19]Law No. 40 of 1966.

[20]Under the Local Government Tax Law (No. 20 of 1965).

Both the full district council and its committees rely heavily on the guidance of the council staff. Each council is required to appoint a secretary and a treasurer, or one person to undertake both jobs, and such other staff as are deemed necessary by each council. Questions about appointments, salary scales, promotions, transfers, termination of service, disciplinary action, or any other matters affecting local government employees are determined by the Minister of Local Government and Lands, with the advice of a Local Government Service Commission. The latter, which operates under regulations published in Legal Notice No. 52 of 1966, is a statutory body appointed by the minister and representative of the interests of government, the local authorities, and staff. In fact, however, this body has rarely met.

Lack of finance and skilled manpower are everywhere the major constraints on the exercise by district councils of their functions; in some cases, too, the work of district councils is hampered because of the lack of co-operation between councils and the traditional authorities. The quality of staff varies widely, reaching a high peak in the Central District, though here as elsewhere there is a severe shortage of trained technical staff. The staffing problem is twofold: the initial recruitment of good-quality staff and the training of those recruited. Hitherto, recruitment has been made difficult because the salary scales of district council employees have compared unfavourably with those of civil servants; local government officers have had limited career prospects and, in the absence of a unified local government service, they have lacked a sense of security. As to training, the great majority of senior staff seem to have received at the most one month's training at the Botswana Training College. The latter could provide longer courses, and places made available to students from Botswana at institutions in Zambia and other African countries could be taken up, if staff members of council were released for training – perhaps through the secondment to councils for substantial periods of district officers on the staff of the District Administration.

In January 1972 the Government took an important step towards the solution of the staffing problem of local authorities by appointing a Commission, under the Chairmanship of Mr. M. J. Pilane, to review the salaries and conditions of service of local government employees. In a very full report[21], the Commission recommended the introduction of cadres and salary scales which parallel those utilised in the public service. It rejected the merger of the central and local government services into a single public service on the grounds that the continued emergence of responsible local authorities would be best promoted by retaining the character and identity of a separate service of their own. It also found unsatisfactory the existing Local Government Service Commission, a statutory body with a part-time membership and ill-defined functions. The Commission believed that the choice lay between creating a Commission with executive powers, or relating the unified local government personnel system to the directorate of personnel in the same way as had been done with the civil service[22]. It recommended the

---

[21] *Report of the Commission on the Salaries and Conditions of Service of Local Government Employees* (Gaborone: mimeo., June 1972).

second alternative. If this recommendation is accepted by the government, a local government division within the directorate of personnel will therefore be responsible, subject in certain cases to the approval of the Minister of Local Government and Lands, for the recruitment and appointment, promotion, transfer, training and discipline of local government officers; the division will also determine personnel policies. The Commission has also recommended that the Local Government Service Commission should fulfil the same disciplinary appeal functions as does the Public Service Commission for the civil service.

The second major problem facing local authorities is financial. This problem is directly linked to the functions of these authorities, which devote the major part of their revenue to primary education to the neglect of other services – particularly in the rural areas. In 1969, taking the country as a whole, some 67 per cent of council expenditure was on education, as against 29 per cent for development projects, including public works (mechanical), housing and building maintenance, 1.8 per cent for health, and 0.002 per cent for community development. If the town councils are excluded from these calculations, the proportion of expenditure which district councils devoted to education was much higher; thus, it was estimated that the Central District Council spent 80 per cent of its revenue (including grants) on education in 1969 as against 0.64 per cent on health, 0.27 per cent on sanitation, 0.21 per cent on destitutes, and 1 per cent on community development. Whereas it was estimated that councils spent R1,470,616 on education in 1969, they received only R316,490 in the form of grants for primary school teachers' salaries from the Central Government (this amount represented 87 per cent of the total government grant)[23]. Since early 1970 there has been discussion within a number of ministries as to whether central government should itself bear a heavier proportion of the cost of teachers' salaries, thereby enabling the councils both to give more attention to the quality of school buildings and equipment and to provide a wider range of local services. To date, however, the central government has maintained its former policy; one argument advanced in its favour is that it is preferable for local authorities to be given a major, identifiable function to perform than to disperse its efforts over a wide area. The result is that the district councils still bear the character of local education boards, if to a slightly less extent than in 1969: the estimates of revenue and expenditure for 1972 show that the expenditure of the nine district councils was R2,572,641 and that of this amount, they spent R1,552,150 on education as aagainst R275,180

---

[22]The Directorate of Personnel was established in July 1970 under the Public Service Act, 1970 (Act No. 26 of 1970). It is responsible to the Permanent Secretary, Office of the President, for public service recruitment, training and localisation, and for the day-to-day supervision of the administration of the public service. It provides an advisory service for Ministries and Departments on civil service matters.

[23]Information provided by the Ministry of Local Government and Lands. In the past, the Central Government has made five types of grant to local authorities: grants to teachers' salaries; capitation grants; development grants for projects; training grants; and grants for destitutes.

on development projects. Total income of the nine district councils (excluding grants) was R1,763,638[24].

Local authorities, therefore, still lack the financial resources to provide a wide range of services. Indeed, in 1972 the position was in certain respects worse than in 1970, when some district councils had accumulated surplus reserves which, with the assistance (not always forthcoming) of the technical departments of government, they could use for development purposes. In 1972, however, every council except one (the North-West District Council, a tourist area) was in financial deficit mainly through having to pay the salary increases awarded to teachers in the unified teaching service[25]. In these circumstances, development may almost grind to a halt unless the district councils can find external backing for their local development projects; such backing is becoming increasingly easy to secure, always providing that the councils can present project memoranda in a proper form.

2. *The Traditional Authorities*

We have already noted the negative attitude adopted by some traditional authorities towards the district councils. The fact seems to be that the great majority of people still pledge their loyalty to the Chief rather than to the council. This is another way of saying that, at the base of the political system in Botswana, legitimacy tends to adhere to traditional rather than to modern local government institutions.

Under the Chieftainship Law of 1965[26], the recognition, appointment, deposition and suspension of the eight Botswana Chiefs is vested in the President. The Chiefs are allowed to maintain customary courts, to arrest offenders (using their own tribal police for this purpose), and seize stolen property. They can regulate tribal affairs and convene tribal meetings in *kgotla*. Until 1968 (and effectively until 1970) they had the right to allocate tribal land. Initially, too, Chiefs were appointed *ex-officio* chairmen of district councils; though they have now been replaced by elected chairmen, they remain *ex-officio* councillors. They are also members of Botswana's House of Chiefs, an advisory body to the National Assembly on bills relating to the amendment of the Constitution and on tribal and customary matters. Moreover, following the Government's White Paper on the (D.L.) Pilane Report (November 1970)[27], the salaries and conditions of service of Chiefs, Deputy Chiefs, headmen, tribal police and other Tribal Administration employees were improved in order to bring them more closely into line with those of the public service; the increased salary scales were backdated to 1 April 1971.

---

[24] *Town and District Councils: Estimates of Revenue and Expenditure, 1972, op. cit.*, pp. 3-5

[25] As a result of the *Report of the Commission on the Salaries and Conditions of Service of the Public Service and the Teaching Service* (Gaborone: Government Printer, July 1970), and the Government White Paper thereon of September 1970.

[26] *No. 29 of 1965.*

[27] *Report of the Commission of Enquiry into the Salaries and Conditions of Service of Tribal Administration Employees* (Gaborone: Government Printer, November 1970), and Government White Paper thereon of August 1971.

Despite their retention of certain powers, the award of better salaries and conditions of service, and their undoubted influence over the people, the Chiefs and other traditional office-holders feel that they have been humbled since independence in favour of the new district councils. No attempt was made to review Tribal Administration salaries at the time that these councils were formed, and the councils took over most of the Tribal Administration's assets and staff. Chiefs and their subordinates resented the loss of other powers, including the custody of *matimela* (impounded) cattle[28], the right to regiment labour, and the right of headmen to receive a commission for their assistance with tax collection. They were offended by the disrespectful attitude sometimes shown towards them by councillors, some of whom would ask headmen to call a *kgotla* meeting without giving any indication of what was to be discussed. The loss of the exclusive power of the Chief to allocate land has been a further source of grievance. Under the Tribal Land Act, 1968[29] (which came into operation in January 1970), and associated legislation and regulations, the power of allocating land within a given tribal area was taken out of the hands of the Chief (and Sub-Chief and headman acting on his behalf) and transferred to a Land Board and Subordinate Land Boards. Though the Chief was made an *ex-officio* member of the Board, he had to share his former power with another traditional member appointed by himself, two representatives of the relevant district council, and two members appointed by the Minister of Local Government and Lands.

It is now evident that the transition from the pre-independence situation where local power lay with the tribal authorities to one where it has passed increasingly to modern-type local authorities, has been too abrupt either for the Chiefs to accept gracefully or for the people to understand fully. For the Government to abolish chieftainship outright would involve too great a political risk, given the strong attachment of the people to that institution. Political considerations, too – notably, the challenge to the ruling BDP made by the tradition-orientated Botswana National Front (BNF)[30] – have not encouraged the Government to resort to a device which, in not dissimilar circumstances, Ghana adopted between 1951 and 1959: that is, to provide for a substantial traditional representation on the rural local authorities. The Minister of Local Government and Lands already has the power to nominate members to a district (or town) council, and there is no legal provision which prevents him using that power to add more traditional members to the council. No action on these lines has been taken, or indeed can be expected; but other ways and means of closely associating the tribal administration with the district councils have still to be worked out.

---

[28] The former powers of the Chiefs in relation to *matimela* were transferred to the district councils under the Matimela Act, 1968 (Act No. 25 of 1968), which took effect in August 1969.

[29] Act No. 54 of 1968, amended by the Tribal Land (Amendment) Act, 1969 (No. 48 of 1969).

[30] The effective control of the BNF has now passed from its radical-minded founders to the traditionalists, led by Mr. Bathoen Gaseitsewe, M.P., ex-Chief of the Bangwaketse.

3. *The District Administration*

Both the Tribal Administration and local authorities are responsible to the Ministry of Local Government and Lands, which is represented in each district by a District Commissioner and his staff in the District Administration. After independence, the district commissioner undertook a wide miscellany of functions. These included supervising the tribal administration, making tours of inspection, allocating government houses and distributing furniture, arranging the programme for ministerial visits, and serving from time to time as electoral returning officer. He was given statutory powers to perform work on behalf of Ministries, such as Labour and Commerce and Industry, which were either not represented or not adequately represented in the district; thus, he acted as registrar of births and deaths on behalf of the Ministry of Home Affairs. In addition, he was responsible for security, retained certain judicial functions, and acted as public relations officer. In other respects, however, between 1966 and 1970 the District Commissioner lost many of the powers which he had enjoyed before independence. Above all, he had no established right to exercise general supervision over the functioning of other government departments within his district, and he had no statutory powers over district and town councils.

Relations between the district commissioner and the local authorities in his district were generally good: in most cases, he was invited to attend meetings of the full council, though he might be excluded from committee, and council officers normally accepted his advice. On the other hand, district commissioners had no redress when their advice was rejected and therefore felt that they operated from a weak base. This feeling was shown at a District Commissioners' Conference held at Gaborone in October 1967 when district commissioners pressed that the Local Government (District Councils) Law 1965, should be amended to give them statutory authority for the supervisory powers which they were encouraged to exercise over the local councils. No immediate action, however, was taken. After further consideration, the Cabinet decided that while there was no case for the creation of a separate cadre of local government officer to inspect the work of the councils, local authorities still needed to be guided and supervised by an agent of the central government. In 1970, therefore, the Local Government (District Councils) Law of 1965, was further amended[31] to make the district commissioner an *ex-officio* member of the district council (and, where appropriate, town council) within his area of jurisdiction, without however the right to vote. The district commissioner was also given the right to call for and inspect all books and records of the council.

Other steps were taken in 1970-71 to strengthen the position of the district commissioner and, thereby, to tackle the problem of weak co-ordination at district level. This problem was acute, and went far beyond the failure to

[31] By *Act No. 14 of 1970*. Earlier amendments had been made in 1966, 1968 and 1969.

pool transport or to operate a central store[32]. Officers in different departments in the same district, even sometimes belonging to the same Ministry (Agriculture and Veterinary, for example) had minimal contact with each other and often next to no contact at all with the district council, the tribal administration and M.Ps. Communications tended to flow vertically out of the district to ministerial headquarters in Gaborone. Other problems arose from a tendency to over-centralise the administration in the capital, and the evident failure of ministries, as well as divisions of the same ministry, to consult each other and thus avoid giving conflicting instructions to ministerial representatives in the field. The latter complained that they were not always consulted before a project for their district was initiated at ministerial level by senior officers who, through infrequent visits to the district, were not conversant with the local situation.

A Presidential circular, which took effect from 1 January 1971, laid down that:

> "In each District, the District Commissioner is the principal representative of Government on political and policy matters. Within the limits of his District he will be responsible for the co-ordination of the District Development Plans and for ensuring the effective implementation, through liaison with Ministerial Officers, of the National Development Plans as they affect projects in his District. In addition, he will be responsible for the efficient conduct of public business and, to this end, will ensure the co-ordination of the activities of all departments in the District."[33]

The President directed that the district commissioner would continue to be directly responsible to the Permanent Secretary of the Ministry of Local Government and Lands and, through him, to the Minister. (This meant that the Government had not been convinced by the arguments put forward by district commissioners at their conference in August 1969, in favour of transferring District Administration to the President's Office. Such a solution would have militated against the general co-ordinating role of the President's Office and would not, moreover, have worked well unless responsibility from district councils and tribal administration had also been assumed by that Office). District Commissioners were not normally to intervene in the affairs of other central government departments rendering professional and technical services in the district. On the other hand, the Presidential circular stated clearly that: "The District Commissioner will be entitled to receive from the departmental officers all the information and assistance he may need for the conduct of public business and for the better administration of the District Development Plan or the execution of the

---

[32] In 1970, the practice was for each Ministry or Department within a district to make its own transport/plant arrangements and to operate its own store; there was very little sharing of resources between Ministries and Departments. The control of transport and plant has now been centralised under a Central Transport Organisation. The possibility of establishing a single store in each district is still being investigated.

[33] *Presidential Circular, 1970: District Commissioners, District Councils and Ministerial Staff at District Level. Co-ordination of Work* (Gaborone: 1970).

District Development Committee's decisions". (The District Development Committees were newly-created bodies, and will be discussed in Part Two.) Wherever possible, the district commissioner and the district departmental officers were to settle local difficulties themselves, without reference to the headquarters of the Ministries concerned.

This Presidential circular established the district commissioner as *primus inter pares* within his district. Though he was required to work through his Permanent Secretary in approaching other ministries in Gaborone, those ministries were expected to collaborate with him, through their field representatives and in other respects, in his main task of promoting the development of his district. To the latter end, new machinery – the District Development Committee and the District Development Conference – was instituted, and existing machinery was refurbished.

The District: Some Aspects of Administration and Politics in West Malaysia

By J. H. BEAGLEHOLE

Dr. Beaglehole is a senior Lecturer in the Department of Politics, La Trobe University, Australia.

THE system of district administration which the British set up in India became the model which was adopted later in other British dependencies. The principle of this form of administration was the appointment of government officers in sub-national areas as representatives of the State, the officer concerned being the embodiment of the authority of government in the area[1]. All other officials in the district were in practice subordinate to him, and he was the main channel of communication between government and the people. The difficult nature of communication and the limited number of specialist officers available meant that the DO inevitably possessed a wide degree of discretionary power, and was the focus of all administration in the district.

In the colonial setting the DO had generally combined the basic functions of government, namely the raising of revenue and the maintenance of law and order[2] which, in the absence of any major programmes of development, had constituted his chief responsibilities. He was also executive head of the district and residual legatee of whatever government felt it necessary to delegate in a variety of areas of responsibility. The system of administration then was mainly that of single-line communication between the people and higher levels of government, and because the authority of the DO was largely free, from political pressures until a later stage, he continued to be the focus of decision-making at district level. This position of authority was derived from both powers and status of his office, the latter being in most cases strengthened by the racial difference between administrator and administered.

Before the transfer of power in the dependencies, the position of the DO had already begun to undergo change as a result of general social, political and administrative developments, changes that reflected the growth of structural differentiation in administration and in society as a whole. The single line of administration and communication began to be supplemented by others. Usually the first development was the creation of specialist departments under professional officers. For these officers the vertical links of their

[1]For a valuable comparative analysis of decentralisation, see B. C. Smith, *Field Administration.*

[2]In the history of Indian district administration the question of the combination or separation of executive and judicial functions was for long an issue of debate. As a result of the Indian Mutiny it was finally decided that the DO should retain both functions. Haridwar Rai, "The Changing Role of the District Officer (1860-1960)", *Indian Journal of Public Administration* 9 (2), 1963, p. 239.

departments soon became more important than their horizontal links to the general administrator in the district and the result was an undermining of the unity of authority at that level[3].

In her overseas territories, Britain had regarded the development of local government as the key to general political development and self-government. However, the grant of certain maintenance and development functions to popularly elected bodies created an additional source of erosion of the powers and functions of the DO, and a new channel of communication between government and the people. Local government did in some cases serve its intended purpose, at least initially, but was quickly overwhelmed as political action moved rapidly on to the national stage, backed by the increasing strength of nationally organised political parties. The result of the latter was the emergence of a completely new structure outside the administration, which was to affect the position of the DO as the focus of decision-making, and to pose the broader question of how this form and tradition of administration could be accommodated within a democratic political system.

The purpose of this paper is to examine some of the consequences of these changes for the role of the district officer and district administration in the post-independence period, the material being based on a case study of one state in West Malaysia, the State of Kelantan. However, for comparative purposes, reference will occasionally be made to the experience of other areas of Malaysia.

Kelantan was chosen as the area of research for a number of reasons. As a former Unfederated Malay State, it possesses its own State civil service, and since 1959 has been controlled by the main post-independence opposition party, Partai Islam. Moreover, for a variety of reasons the State has not fully shared in the social and economic developments of modern Malaysia. These factors made Kelantan perhaps the most fruitful area for the study of administrative change, and the interaction of administration and politics at the sub-national level.

The paper will be primarily concerned with the DO's role in development and general administration, and the interaction of politics and administration in the district, but in the last part of the paper some consideration will be given to present trends and possible future developments in relation to field administration in Malaysia. This will also involve some discussion of the proposals of the recent Report of the Royal Commission on local government[4], and their implications.

The Structure of District Administration

The districts in Kelantan are on the whole small both in area and population, the State itself having a population less than that of a typical district in

---

[3]See for example, *Report of the Royal Commission upon Decentralisation in India*, (1908), vol. 1, p. 187.

[4]Federation of Malaysia, *Report of the Royal Commission of Enquiry to Investigate the Workings of Local Authorities in West Malaysia*, 1968 (Hereinafter cited as RRC). *A second article by Dr. Beaglehole will appear in our April 1974 issue, dealing with the Report of the Commission.*—Ed.

India. Communications between the State capital and all district headquarters are good and so permit a considerable degree of centralisation and control.

Kelantan is divided into eight districts all headed by a district officer, every district office being a sub-treasury and land office. The district is further divided into *daerah* under an officer called a *penggawa*, the *daerah* being in turn divided into *mukims* in which government is represented by a *penghulu*, who is not, however, unlike the DO and *penggawa*, a member of the civil service establishment.

The staff of the district office consists of general administrative officers assisted by clerical and other staff, all being members of the State civil service. Overall responsibility for the work of the district office rests with the DO whose main support is provided by Assistant District Officers. Some of these ADOs will be gazetted as Collectors and assistant collectors solely concerned with land functions, other ADOs being delegated work by the DO, sharing his rseponsibilities in numerous committees chaired by the DO, acting as adviser to local councils and assisting generally in district office administration. Since 1970 in Kelantan the administration of land matters has been taken over by the collector who, except in matters of policy, is entirely responsible for land administration in the district, and is directly answerable to the State director of lands and mines.

In former Unfederated Malay States like Kelantan, the generalist administrators and clerical workers as well as public labour employees are recruited by the State for its own service. All its technical and specialist officers, however, are on loan or secondment from the Federal Service. The general position is that federal officers serving in the State are paid by the State, and are therefore responsible to the State government during their period of service in the State. This does not apply in the case of officers of Statutory Boards, such as MARA, or federal departments, such as education, who are paid by and directly responsible to their federal headquarters. In the majority of cases, however, clerical staff even in federal departments are members of the State clerical service.

Including statutory bodies, there are over twenty specialist services operating at district level, but the actual structures of their administration vary between services. The shape of administration is determined by a number of factors, particularly the system of communications, the shortage of personnel and the nature of the service provided.

While the main communications system in Kelantan is good, within the districts they are often more difficult. Furthermore, many of the specialist departments suffer from a shortage of officers and therefore cannot staff each district. For these reasons, below district level, many departments depend on the generalist field administrators, the DO, *penggawa* and *penghulu*. Within Kelantan the structure of departments varies widely. Some have officers stationed in every district, others have none, concentrating all their officers at headquarters, while some departmental officers cover more than one district. In all cases, however, departments have to provide for some representation on a district basis, as the district is still regarded as one of the chief levels of administrative co-ordination.

Within each district local authorities have their own administrative boundaries. Local representative councils were not established over the whole country, and their areas of jurisdiction do not include most of the population or land area of the district. Local government, however, falls within the responsibility of district administration and in no case do the boundaries of a local authority extend beyond those of the district.

The DO and District Administration

The DO in Kelantan is a State officer, usually with a lower standard of formal education than his Malayan Civil Service equivalent. He is, however, likely to be older than a DO in the West coast States, and indeed older than the district-level officers of most of the professional departments. He therefore possesses greater administrative experience than his administrative colleagues in the district, over half of the DOs in Kelantan having been in the service for ten years or more.

The prestige of the office of DO is partly a legacy of the colonial period, but in Kelantan his authority is strengthened by the legitimacy of tradition. Until recently many civil servants were recruited from the Kelantanese aristocracy, and even today DOs often bear a title of rank. Kelantan is an area of Malaysia that has only recently begun to feel the impact of development, and where, in spite of adjustments to new social pressures, the influence of traditional sources of power cannot be entirely ignored. However, although the relationship between the DO and the people may have some of the appearances of paternalism, the political changes since independence have meant that it is a paternalism without power – a situation which has been described as one in which the power to command has been replaced by the duty to persuade.

Since the Emergency top priority has been given to the role of the DO as "the natural and single leader of his district"[5]. This leadership is based upon a number of factors, in particular the nature of the office itself and the ecology of administration which influences the style of administration. In terms of Weber's analysis of power and authority, it can be said that the office of DO combines authority based on the charisma of the office itself, and the legal-rational authority which derives from the specific responsibilities given to this officer under a rational system of delegation of functions. The conditions of the society in which the administrator has to work, and the kinds of tasks which government has imposed on this field administrator, tend to give greater weight to the non-legal/rational bases of his authority than would be found in a functional system of decentralisation.

The importance of the leadership role of the DO is partly a result of certain features of the social environment in a developing society. The DO today is typically involved in a variety of voluntary organisations filling the gaps in community leadership, which in the more urbanised areas are, however, being gradually filled from within the community itself. The DO is also seen to be important as a mediator and arbitrator in the community, a role

[5]Federation of Malays, *Report of the Land Administration Commission*, 1958, p. 18.

which he is able to play because of the prestige of his office, and the image of the DO as the impartial representative of Government. Certain types of conflict, for example, ethnic ones, cannot be dealt with easily by formal legal and administrative processes, and the administrator is in any case primarily concerned with preventing potential conflict coming to a head, hence his value in the role of mediator who can take the initiative in maintaining the cohesion of the local community.

The original functions of the DO, namely magisterial and land administration responsibilities, are no longer an important part of his work. In 1948 district circuit magistrates were appointed, and since then the DO is no longer involved in the substantial periods of court work which were characteristic of the routine of the pre-war DO[6]. Land administration used to be regarded as the most important part of a DO's work, but from the time of the Emergency in the 1950's it was already clear that this facet was being accorded a low priority in district administration. From 1970, following the practice previously adopted in parts of Johore, the DO in Kelantan ceased to be collector of land revenue, and the duties involved being given a full-time land administrator.

While there has been a rapid decline in the work of the DO in his traditional fields of administration, other responsibilities have been added or expanded. Apart from the management of the district office, the list of duties of a Kelantan DO would today include the chairmanship of about thirteen official committees (apart from voluntary organisations), responsibility as registrar under a variety of legislation, and general responsibility for local government affairs.

The main concerns of the present day DO, however, are development and security – reflecting the priorities of the government of Malaysia under the Second Malaysia Plan. Both issues, development and security, are now seen as interrelated, the solution of the security problem being considered to depend ultimately on the success of the socio-economic development programme, in consequence the field administrator is usually given a major responsibility for co-ordination in relation to development.

The basis for the co-ordinating role of the DO is the instruction issued in General Orders requiring all departments to "keep in touch with and comply with the wishes of the District Officer in the execution of their duties . . . and keep him informed of the progress of all important works and schemes"[7]. They further stipulate that the DO should report all cases of departmental conflict which cannot be resolved at district level. In Kelantan since the end of the Emergency these requirements have been largely inoperative as will be explained later in this article. Under the Second Malaysia Plan, however, new administrative structures and procedures have been established by federal directive at all levels from district to federal. There are two working

[6]The DO is, however, gazetted as first class magistrate in which capacity he is largely concerned with the signing of warrants and charges, acting as commissioner of oaths, and occasionally appearing in court to remand prisoners and adjourn cases.

[7]Federation of Malaya, *General Orders*, Cap. M, p. 1-8.

committees, one for development and one for security. These committees, chaired by the DO, consist entirely of government officers, the only difference in composition being that the security committee includes representatives of the army and the police. Above these committees is a district action committee consisting of all the officers of the other two committees, but also including elected politicians from the district. This committee organisation is part of a nation-wide structure of co-ordination. Both the development and action committees keep minutes of the proceedings, copies of which are forwarded immediately to the State and federal governments. In Kuala Lumpur all minutes are received by the Implementation, Co-ordination and Evaluation Unit of the Prime Minister's Department, which analyses the problems raised by the information from the districts. The directive requiring the setting-up of these committees also stipulated that they were to meet every week, the development committee twice a week. The result was therefore a substantial increase in the burden of committee work for both the DO and other district-level officers.

The machinery of development in the district has two inter-related functions, co-ordination and communication. The objects of district co-ordination are the removal of bottlenecks by trying to ensure the co-operation of all departments concerned, and the decentralisation of co-ordination so that issues that are raised at a lower level can be settled at that level, failing which the district structure can serve as a communication channel to the State and federal authorities. Co-ordination and communication are of two kinds, horizontal and vertical. In the district the former involves co-ordination between district level officers, and the task of vertical co-ordination cum-communication requires co-operation between the various departments, the lower levels of administration and direct communication with the people.

The designation of DO as chairman of the new committee system established to implement a national programme of development agreed to by all State governments, has clothed him with both State and Federal authority in matters of development. Furthermore, the DO is the representative of the State government in the district and is therefore the "voice" of State power in a sense in which no other officer can be. The committee process itself places the DO as chairman in a position of authority and promotes co-ordination. The value of the committee system lies in bringing people together regularly, the need for this being partly the result of the personal factors involved in co-operation, where differences of personality and status between officers may complicate relations between departments, and partly the physical problem of bringing departmental representatives together regularly for purposes of co-operation. The relationship between the DO and other officers in the committee is not one in which the DO issues formal instructions to other departments, but the situation within the committee itself forces an attitude of co-operation.

Co-ordination at the district level also depends on the system of communications upwards to the State and Federal governments, information about the problems of administration in the district being provided by the regular despatch of committee minutes. Such a system, however, makes

certain assumptions about the nature of administrative behaviour which may not be applicable in some kinds of administrative environment, particularly the assumption that administrators are willing to "expose" their administrative colleagues. Besides, no machinery *per se* can guarantee that co-operation will be forthcoming. The unco-operative attitude of a department can be hidden behind pleas of inadequate resources, or the problem may be one of maladministration in a particular department, about which neither the committee nor one level of government alone can do very much to rectify.

On the whole, however, the work of the committees is mainly that of communication in a more limited sense, very often amounting simply to a conveying of information. Departments each make progress reports as to what is being and will be done by the department concerned, and in some cases almost all committee business is of this kind.

However, in so far as the communication functions is one of obtaining the co-operation of district administration for communication downwards to the villages, the work of the district committee is still important. The reasons for this are: (a) the heavy dependence of many short-staffed departments on the generalist administrator to act on their behalf in rural areas in particular; (b) the nature of many development programmes which calls for administrators to adopt an educative as much as an executory role, faced with the task of persuading and securing the co-operation of the people. One constant theme of committee meetings is the need for the co-operation of generalist and specialist officers for the implementation of programmes, and the problems of getting over to the people the need for support. The need for this co-operation is partly the result of the fact that the formal link between the professional departments and the villages is provided through the DO. However, the nature of these programmes and the style of administration with its emphasis on face-to-face communication, also place a high premium on communication skills and local knowledge and influence, which the DO alone among the administrators seems able to supply.

The DO is not only the chairman of these committees but he is also the representative of the whole district and therefore sits on the committees in a "specialist" capacity. He brings to the committee the problems of the district which have reached him through the main official channels of communication from the villages, such as *penggawa* meetings, or matters raised in direct meetings between the DO and the people. It is through the same channels that the replies and requests of the several departments are conveyed to the villages.

This account of the role of the DO in general administration reflects some of the changes and problems resulting from the growth of structural differentiation in administration. However, probably the most important factor influencing the role of the DO since independence is that he now works within a political context.

Politics and Administration

General Considerations

Discussion of the relationship between politics and administration presents a special difficulty in view of the ambiguity associated with this type of field

administration. The view of the relationship between politics and administration which emphasised the separation of these functions never applied to the continental tradition of prefectoral administration[8]. Writing of the unique position of the prefect in French public life, Chapman comments:

> "He is the administrator who is part politician and the politician who is a first-class administrator . . . His role is partly administration, partly politics, partly social leadership."[9]

This is no less true of his non-European counterpart, the district officer.

It is, however, not only the ambiguity of the office itself that poses problems in this analysis, but the kinds of goals which the governments of new nations have in some cases adopted. Often development objectives are designed to achieve cultural as well as physical outputs, requiring not only the implementation of technical programmes but a re-shaping of the values of the community. Therefore, whereas bureaucracy is a style of administration which emphasises values that create a particular limited role for the administrator, in development programmes administrators are required to go beyond their more limited instrumental role and assume that of social and political leadership.

The different role of the administrator in those conditions is also partly the result of the style of administration which is expected by government, and which to some extent has to be adopted in conditions of underdevelopment, as well as the decision of government to use the DO and the district as a key level of co-ordination.

Problems of the relationship between administrator and politician also arise from the nature of the political process itself. The intensely competitive nature of politics, the need for the mobilisation of political support and the poverty of the people (in a developing country) tend to create a symbiotic relationship between political leaders and supporters thereby producing the characteristics of machine politics. Where the environment is one of relative poverty, the ability to retain the autonomy of administration is also limited by the extent to which administration is concerned with critical decisions. Under these conditions many decisions have to be made whose consequences are not ones of marginal loss but absolute deprivation, a situation which results in extensive politicisation of administrative decision-making[10].

Finally, one of the perennial problems of this form of field administration is that it is administration of a local community by a locally resident administrator, and therefore tends to make considerable demands on the empathy of the administrator. This is a situation that has become even more pronounced as a result of the changed political environment of the post-

---

[8]A. B. Spitzer, "Bureaucrat as Proconsul: The Restoration Prefect and the Police Generale", *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, Vol. 7, 1965.

[9]B. Chapman, *The Prefects and Provincial Administration*, p. 144.

[10]For a fuller discussion of some of these points, see the excellent study by B. B. Schaffer, "Deadlock in Development Administration", Colin Leys (ed.), *Politics and Change in Developing Countries*, p. 190.

independence period and the promotion of development programmes which emphasise the "co-operative" nature of the administrative process. Under these conditions the relations between politician and administrator, and between politician and administrator on the one hand and the people on the other, may be much closer than in a developed Western society. This is itself a reflection of underdevelopment, which creates a dependence of the people on political and administrative channels to an extent which is less likely to be found in more highly developed social and administrative systems.

Politics and Administration – The Case of Kelantan

The environment of politics in Kelantan has two chief characteristics which substantially shape the relationship between administration and politics in the State:

(a) The existence of political parties in a State that displays a high level of politicisation under conditions of intense political competition.

(b) The control of the State government by an opposition party within a federal system of government.

Discussion of the relationship between administration and politics in Kelantan that follows takes the form of a brief account of the resources available to the State and federal governments for the achievement of their political objectives, and of some of the consequences of the politicisation of decision-making on the role of the DO.

The Constitution of Malaysia allocates most major functions to the central government. State governments in West Malaysia are left mainly with religion, land, agriculture, forests, local government and some shared functions, probably the most important politically being public works. The value of those powers retained by the State is qualified by the financial imbalance between the State and federal governments, since under the Constitution the main sources of revenue are federal preserves. However, the Constitution also provides for guaranteed grants to each State, and the federal government can also provide financial help either through projects undertaken directly by federal departments, or by loans and advances to the States. Where a State government is controlled by an opposition party, as in Kelantan, the resources constitutionally available to it are limited, and it is therefore to be expected in these circumstances that the State government will make the maximum use of what resources it may possess in order to preserve its political power; a problem compounded in Kelantan by the relatively low level of development of the State's own resources.

One result of federal predominance in the allocation of functions and in the structure of administration in Malaysia is that the majority of departments operating within the State are either federal departments, or State departments in which officers are federal civil servants on secondment to the State. However, as has already been pointed out, Kelantan has its own State civil service from which all the generalist administrators are recruited, and the whole generalist structure down to *mukim* level is entirely controlled by the

State. This control of the main line of communication between the people and higher levels of administrations is of some importance, because in conditions of limited administrative development most departments have to make some use of the State structure for the administration of their own programmes. The State government exercises no formal control over federal departments, however, and the same applies to the statutory bodies some of which administer services with significant political potential, such as loans and licences. Moreover, although many of these Federal departments depend to some extent on the State administration at lower level, since 1962 the Federal government has established its own administrative lines of communication at sub-district level through the social development department, the political arm of the Ministry of National and Rural Development.

The effect of federal State conflict on the generalist field administrator will depend upon a number of factors. In particular the extent to which administrative office is itself one of the spoils of political power, how far the administrator is involved in procedures whose results are considered to have political significance and which can be politically manipulated, and the degree of concensus within the society and the administration.

As has already been pointed out both the DO and the sub-district officer, the *penggawa*, are responsible to the State government. They are, however, appointed by a State Public Service Commission and protected by service conditions, although the State government effectively controls matters of transfer, and in the case of *penggawas* this power has been used with some frequency to discipline and control these subordinate officials. The *penghulu* is not a civil servant but is appointed by the State government and in practice he is, like his counterpart in other States, a political appointment[11].

Important for an understanding of the problem of administrative-political relations in this form of field administration is the extent to which the DO is still used as the focus of decision-making. The problem can be stated in the form of an obvious preposition, that where political decisions are made political pressures will be applied. Partly as a result of the high degree of politicisation, it can be said that the DO in Kelantan is subject to less political pressure than his counterpart in the Alliance-controlled States, because the State and federal governments have established effective political decision-making structures, which by-pass the existing administrative ones. Whereas, in general, this applies to all States with regard to the politically important areas of land administration and minor projects, in the field of development administration also the DO in Kelantan has been largely excluded from the planning and decision-making process.

Unlike the model of the Red-Book system*, in Kelantan the district development committee is not an important channel for demands from below, this function being performed by the party organisations to State and

[11]The penghulu's influence however will depend upon the relationship he establishes with the people in the mukim.

*See Ferguson, "The Story of Development in Malaya", Journal of Administration Overseas, Vol. IV, No. 3.—Ed.

federal levels by Partai Islam and the Alliance respectively. As a result, in so far as the district administrative structure is used, the role of the DO is confined to co-ordination and implementation.

Although the political environment is one of State-Federal conflict, both governments are, however, committed to development objectives, and there has emerged since the Second Malaysia Plan what appears to be a readiness to accept a greater measure of mutual co-operation. With the increasing federalisation of development, the DO today is heavily involved in administering what are directly or indirectly federal programmes, and in trying to harness support for broad national goals. One consequence of opposition control of the State government, however, is the absence of that close identification of party and administration which has become such a significant feature of administration in the Alliance-controlled States.

Although the situation in Kelantan is one in which development is largely influenced by party interests, some DOs nevertheless feel the need to play a positive role in development in accordance with both the public's, and their own, perception of their office. As a result, DOs have in some cases become lobbyists, representing the needs of their districts and exploiting all the resources available to them in order to obtain support for specific projects. If, as recent changes in policy indicate, the DO is to be given a larger share in development decisions, there is a possibility that the DO in Kelantan will be faced with the same kind of role conflict as his counterpart in the West Coast States.

The DO in Kelantan can be said to be relatively well protected from direct political pressure. He nevertheless frequently experiences a conflict of roles and crises of conscience in certain areas of administration, particularly in regard to land. Furthermore, the social and political environment of administration is such that the administrator is acting within conscious restraints affecting the quality of administration and making enforcement one of the major problems of administration in Kelantan, particularly in regard to land and local government administration. The problem is then partly a technical one of administrative procedures and their relation to policy, but the dilemma of the DO raises the much broader issue of the future of this kind of field administration in a democratic political system.

The Future of District Administration

In some of the developing areas the immediate reaction after independence was to abolish the DO who was seen as a legacy of colonialism[12]. The attack on the position of the DO, however, although widespread, was not universal, and even where proposals were made to abolish the office these were sometimes rejected. Politicisation has in some cases had different results. In Tanzania independence was followed by the complete politicisation of district administration, the District Commissioner being replaced by an area com-

[12]See, for example, C. A. G. Wallis, "Local Administration in the Sudan", *Journal of African Administration*, Vol. 13, 1961, p. 162.

missioner, a political appointee, the civil service administrator becoming his area secretary in the district[13]. Essentially the same pattern was adopted in Zambia. Discussion of the problems of district administration in a post-colonial setting has been most evident in what can be regarded as the "home" of British district administration, India. There, in many respects, conditions seemed unfavourable for the survival of the DO. It was clear at an early stage long before independence that the DO was under challenge both from the development of specialist departments, and elected representative bodies. Furthermore, the concept of development from below formed an important part of Indian nationalist philosophy, a concept later embodied in *panchayati raj*. In spite of such a strong commitment to the ideal of local self-government, there are now indications that trends resulting in a weakening of the DO's position may now be moving in reverse[14].

In Malaysia the position of the DO has not been a public issue since independence. The experience in Malaysia as elsewhere is that the traditional role of this officer has been eroded by specialisation and politicisation, but these have been offset by a certain combination of factors in the Malaysian experience. Firstly there has been a continuity in administrative and political institutions as a result of the nature of the transfer of power in Malaysia, which was not marked by reaction against colonial institutions. Secondly, the period before and after independence was one of communist insurgency which required a strengthening of executive power at all levels. Both these factors probably helped to shape a third, Malaysia's administrative approach to development which characterised the rural development programmes of the early 1960s. The events of more recent years have in the government's view strengthened further the arguments for maintaining the existing form of field administration.

In 1969, however, the Royal Commission on The Workings of Local Authorities in West Malaysia finally submitted its report which contained the first serious attack on the DO as a system of administration in Malaysia. Although the terms of reference of the Royal Commission were confined to local government issues, one of the conclusions reached was the need for a complete reorganisation of local government, inevitably involving a re-examination of the whole shape of field administration. With regard to the position of the DO, the Commission took the view that Malaysia would have to make a choice between two traditions of administration, and that once strong local representative institutions were set up then the DO should cease to exist. In a sweeping criticism of district administration it commented:

"It cannot be denied that his (DO) continued existence as the main

---

[13]W. Tordoff, "Regional Administration in Tanzania", *The Journal of Modern African Studies*, 3 (1), 1965, p. 75. The purely administrative functions, however, are carried out by the Secretary to the Area Commissioner who is a civil servant.

[14]P. R. Dubhashi, "Whither District Administration?", *Kurukshetra*, 1961, p. 35, and C. V. H. Rao, "Overhaul of District Administration in Andhra", Economic and Political Weekly, Vol. 2 (22), 1967.

power symbol and centre has become anachronistic and not compatible to (*sic*) local democratic institution."[15]

The report proposed that land and revenue should be separated from the responsibilities of the DO, and once this had occurred the commission saw only two functions remaining for him, namely local government, and welfare and miscellaneous services. The main recommendations of the report if implemented would therefore have radical implications for the position of the DO. It proposed that the whole of West Malaysia be covered by elected local authorities, and even more radical in its implications was its proposal that the new executive authority of the council should be the focal point of administration in the district, the local authority itself assuming responsibility for the welfare and development services at present performed by the DO. If this was accompanied as it suggested, by the taking over of land revenue functions by a full-time land officer, the DO, so it was argued, would become completely redundant.

The report's recommendations have been rejected by the Government of Malaysia. The commission exposed itself to the not unfair criticism that although it presented radical conclusions on the future of the DO, it failed to examine the role of the DO with the same care it had directed to its study of local government. If it had done so it would have probably been made to realise the weight of opinion opposed to its own particular solution.

A proposal for drastic and immediate change in the present form of district administration has to face a natural reluctance to abandon a tried system of administration. This conservatism is based partly on the legacy of tradition[16], but is also grounded in the fear that the sudden abolition of a deeply-rooted system of administration would give rise not only to administrative problems, but, in the words of one senior official, "to a social and psychological shock to the general population". A view that is part of a more general argument very often stated that there is a felt-need for this type of administration on the part of the people themselves.

Some of the very developments that have resulted in the changed position of the DO, however, have tended to create new roles that are considered to be of continuing relevance. The growth of political institutions has so politicised the channels of communication, it is argued, that it is essential for government to have an impartial source of information regarding the needs of development in the district, and for the people to have available a court of appeal[17]. Even the elected politician to some extent expects the DO to fulfil this role, and where the co-operation of the people is needed

---

[15]RRC, p. 165.

[16]On some of the reasons for the survival of this form of field administration in former British colonial areas, see V. Subramaniam, "The Relative Status of Specialists and Generalists: An Attempt at a Comparative Historical Explanation", *Public Administration*, 1968.

[17]In a recent study of district administration in India, it is particularly this role of DO as ombudsman or grievances officer that has been seen as one of the important functions of the DO in the future. Administrative Reforms Commission, *Report of a Study Team on District Administration*, p. 98.

by both politician and specialist departments, the services of the DO, with a prestige and status partly based on this image of impartiality, are often invoked. However, under Kelantan conditions, this role is not to be confused with that of an ombudsman. The latter not only hears grievances; he has the power to act on them, and this the DO cannot do in any matter which is seen to affect party interests.

This image of impartiality is in turn related to the view that the growth of specialist departments and the commitment to development have combined to strengthen the case for the DO, in that the new structures and objectives of administration have increased the importance of co-ordination and communication. Given the objectives of rural development and the sheer shortage of administrative skills and personnel, the generalist administrator cannot be dispensed with, particularly when development programmes require facility in communication and local knowledge, abilities which are considered to be the special province of the DO. Both the nature of some of these development programmes, and the limited scope of specialist departments also compel the latter to make use of the generalist field administration at sub-district level. If this sub-structure is necessary, the appointment of an officer with a general responsibility for these sub-district officials is probably unavoidable.

The abolition of the DO would, moreover, have far-reaching consequences for both administration and society as a whole. It would in the first place raise the problem of how such officials were to be absorbed, a problem compounded in the case of Kelantan by the fact that these administrators possess a lower standard of formal qualification than federal officers. But perhaps a greater consequence is that their abolition would entail the removal of the strongest Malay component of the administrative structure, a structure which is at the same time an integral part of the status system of the society.

Furthermore, any proposal for change in the character of field administration must offer a viable alternative to the present structure. However, the history of local government in Malaysia has done little to convince informed opinion that local elected authorities in general at present provide an alternative to district and specialist field administration, and my findings on the state of local government in Kelantan seem to confirm this[18].

The future of district administration, however, raises wider issues including the problems of area administration in general. It is now clear that the State and Federal governments in Malaysia find that the existing areas and structures of administration no longer provide an adequate framework for major programmes in both urban and rural areas. The result has been the creation of a number of Statutory Boards often with broad development functions, and in all cases covering a number of districts. The establishment of these new regional-type structures raises in a different form the question

---

[18]For a fuller discussion of the problems of local government in the light of the Royal Commission's Report, see the author's forthcoming article, "Local Government in West Malaysia: The Royal Commission Report", *Journal of Administration Overseas*.

of the future of district administration, namely, whether areas originally established for a single purpose, land administration, are still relevant to the needs of development today. The future role of these new bodies, however, and what their relationship will be to existing areas and functions of district administration, is still not clear.

The choice of the form of field administration is as much a political as an administrative one, being determined by general political-cultural factors, and by what the nation considers its priorities to be. The present stage of development in Malaysia has left unresolved the issue of the proper relationship between politician and local administrator, thereby placing some strain both on the administrators themselves and on the norms and standards of administration. It would seem, however, that the trend is towards a re-examination of those norms, a reflection of the government's commitment to the administrative solution of political problems and a policy of de-politicisation. Finally, the experience of post-war Malaysia has favoured a strengthening of local executive power, a tendency reinforced by the events of May 1969, the revival of communist activities and the requirements of the Second Malaysia Plan. Whatever modifications are made it would seem that for political, if not for administrative reasons, the shape of field administration in the forseeable future will be one that not only retains the DO, but will probably see a strengthening of the role of this generalist administrator outside the main urban centres.

GLOSSARY

Daerah	=	Sub-District
Panggawa	=	Sub-District Officer
Mukim	=	Parish
Penghulu	=	Headman
MARA	=	Majlis Amanah Ra'ayat (Council of Indigenous people which is an important Malaysian development authority)

Financing Panchayati Raj in Andhra Pradesh*

By KOMPELLA SIVA SUBRAHMANAYAM

Mr. Subrahmanayam** formerly a Research Fellow in the Department of Economics at Andhra University, Waltair, is now a lecturer in the post graduate Department of Economics, DNR College, Bhimavaram, Andhra Pradesh.

Introduction

PANCHYATI RAJ finance is an almost unexplored zone in the literature of Indian local government. Though the political aspects of Panchayati Raj bodies have, in recent years, been subjected to searching analysis, little attention has been paid to the finances of these bodies. This, undoubtedly, is because of the lack of reliable statistical data.

Local self-government in Andhra Pradesh is at present administered by 20 *Zilla Parishads*, 321 *Panchayat Samithis*, and about 15,300 *Gram Panchayats*. These bodies have operational jurisdiction over respectively, a revenue district, a Block (about 1/20th of a revenue district) and a village or contiguous villages.

The Zilla Parishads, though based at district level, mainly as co-ordinating, supervisory and advisory bodies, have a few executive functions in important fields such as Secondary education, communications and social welfare. They also distribute Union and State Government funds among the Samithis, and ensure the execution of various development schemes.

The Panchayat Samithis, at the middle level, are vested with special executive responsibilities in such fields as elementary and social education, health and sanitation, agriculture and cottage and small-scale industries. They are directly concerned with development activities in these fields.

The functions of the Gram (Village) Panchayats are divided into two categories: obligatory and optional. The obligatory list[1] of functions includes basic civic activities like lighting, water supply, public health, sanitation and communications (other than those vested in Samithis and Parishads). Among their twenty-seven optional functions[2] are dispensaries, parks, libraries, public markets, slaughterhouses and cottage industries.

**The State of Andhra Pradesh includes the Telangana area of the former Hyderabad State.*
In a number of cases tax and other rates, etc., differ in Telangana from the rest of Andhra, but to avoid confusion, these differences have not been particularised in this article.
Similarly, to avoid confusion, the differences between Notified, non-Notified and Tribal Gram Panchayats have not been spelled out.—Ed.

**The author expresses his gratitude to his teacher, Prof. K. V. S. Sastri, for the guidance and encouragement received in the preparation of this article.

[1] The *AP Gram Panchayats Act*, 1964, *S.*54.

[2] *Ibid*, Sections 55, 57-66.

In theory, all three bodies in the Panchayat Raj sector of the State contribute to the tax revenues but, in practice, the burden is carried almost entirely by the Gram Panchayats, of which only just over 5 per cent enjoy incomes of more than 10,000 Rs. per annum*. In 1964-65, for instance, the tax revenues of Gram Panchayats accounted for 99.59 per cent – the rest of the revenue being contributed by the Samithis.

Sources of Revenue available to Panchayati Raj bodies by way of taxation

A. GRAM PANCHAYATS

(1) *Obligatory Taxes.* Of the greatest importance is the House Tax[3] which is the backbone of the Gram Panchayat tax system. It is levied on all houses, including huts; it can be based on capital (the usual practice) or annual value. Maximum and minimum rates are prescribed by the State. Revaluations are undertaken by State officials and in the Sixties resulted in a considerable increase in house values[4]. Appeals lie to the Gram Panchayats and all too often succeed in reducing local tax liabilities. As is usual, Union, educational, religious and charitable properties, etc., are all exempt.

Besides House Tax, a *Profession Tax* is the only other obligatory tax. This resembles a local income tax and is payable by companies in business in the village, by all who follow a particular profession, art or calling or hold public or private appointments – for at least 60 days in the year[5]. Pensions and investment income attract this tax. The tax is on a progressive scale. Those earning less than R.600 pa are exempt and the individual tax rate rises from a minimum of R1 to a maximum of R250[6]. Increased incomes over the past decade and a greater diversity in the employment structure in rural areas has meant a rising potential for this source of revenue* – already taking effect *vide* Table 1.

(2) *Optional Taxes* are little exploited by Gram Panchayats apart from *Vehicle Tax* which is levied on all vehicles other than motor vehicles[7]. Maximum and minimum rates are prescribed and failure to pay can render a vehicle liable to seizure. The tax is mostly concerned with carts, bicycles and cycle-rickshaws. Not all Gram Panchayats levy the tax and few impose a rate much above the obligatory minimum – so increased revenue has been due to more vehicles and not to a higher rate of tax being imposed.

Other Optional taxes, generally in little use, include: a tax on village produce sold in the markets[8]; a toll on vehicles (not motor vehicles) and animals entering a fair ground or festival centre; a tax on travellers leaving fairs or festivals by inland waterways[9]; a special purposes tax for public

*See Table 2.
[3]*Ibid*, Section 70.
[4]A.P. State Administration Reports, 1964-5 – 1966-7.
[5]A.P. Gram Panchayat Act, *op cit.*, Sec. 72(1).
[6]The Constitution of India, *Article* 276.
**The approximate exchange rate is £1 = 18 Rupees.*—Ed.
[7]A.P. Gram Panchayats Act, *op cit.*, S.74.
[8]A.P. (Agricultural Produce & Livestock) Markets Act, 1966, S.4.
[9]A.P. (Andhra Area) Public Health Act 1939, S.117-118.

works. Also optional are a special land tax and a surcharge on the land tax/local cess levied by and collected by the State. Under the Gram Panchayats Act power is also given to impose a special surcharge tax on houses and a tax on agricultural land for specific public utility works.

B. PANCHAYAT SAMITHIS. In Andhra Pradesh there are no obligatory taxes which Panchayat Samithis have to impose. Indeed, there are only two optional taxes: a Pilgrims tax, commonly known as a "passenger tax", and (with State permission) a surcharge on any of the obligatory taxes imposed by Gram Panchayats in their area or on the land tax/local cess levied by the State government – up to a maximum of 25 per cent in each case. By and large the Samithis make such little use of these powers that their revenue from this source has been less than Ro.02 *per capita* or as low as 0.03 per cent of their total receipts[10].

C. ZILLA PARISHADS. The power to impose a *Pilgrim tax* is shared with Samithis in the Andhra area only of the State – this power however is not exercised and so no tax at all is levied at this level in Andhra Pradesh.

In the light of the foregoing outline of taxation sources available to Panchayat bodies it is possible to portray certain characteristic features of Panchayati Raj taxation in Andhra Pradesh. *First*, Gram Panchayats are almost the only taxing authorities in the Panchayati Raj Sector in the State, since the contribution of the upper layers of Panchayati Raj to the tax revenues is infinitesimal. *Secondly*, house tax constitutes the mainstay of Gram Panchayat tax system contributing not less than 70 per cent of the *tax* revenues of Panchayati Raj bodies. *Finally*, despite a spectacular growth during the last decade, tax revenue constitutes a low proportion of the total receipts of Gram Panchayats, let alone the total receipts of the three Panchayati Raj bodies put together. This is due to (a) their reliance on two or three taxes and reluctance to exploit all available sources of tax; (b) the rigidity of their rate structure and the low tax rates imposed; (c) their proverbial laxity and inefficiency in tax collection; and (d) the non-availability of land (land revenue).

Sources of Revenue available to Panchayat Raj bodies by way of non-tax receipts and fees

A. GRAM PANCHAYATS. Licence fees; fines; rents for market stalls, public halls and water tanks; receipts from markets, stationary barrows; interest on investments. These contribute appreciably to the revenues of the larger Gram Panchayats amounting to some 30-40 per cent of their total receipts[11]. They produce little for the smaller bodies and nothing at all in tribal villages.

B. PANCHAYAT SAMITHIS. Non-tax receipts mostly consist of matching contributions made by the people towards development projects which attract equal grants from the State. Samithis also receive small amounts from markets, dispensaries and rents for the lease of Samithi property. This

[10] *Community Development and Panchayati Raj, Andhra Pradesh – Report for* 1964-5 (Panchayati Raj Department, Govt. of Andhra Pradesh, 1968), p. 65.

[11] Community Development and Panchayati Raj, Andhra Pradesh, Report for 1964-65 – *op. cit.*, pp. 57-59.

source of revenue produces a widely varying percentage of total Samithi revenue – in some cases as low as 3 per cent and in 1964/65 an overall average of 14 per cent[12].

C. ZILLA PARISHADS. Non-tax revenue receipts for Zilla Parishads consist of school fees; rent from rest-house receipts, public halls and other property; hire charges for tools and plant; endowments; interest on investments; contributions from the people and from markets.

Sources of Revenue available to Panchayat Raj bodies by way of transfer from the State Government

A. GRAM PANCHAYATS

(1) *Entertainment Tax*[13]. After a 5 per cent deduction for management charges, the State transfers the net proceeds of Entertainment Tax. The rate for cinema shows is at 35-45 per cent on the cost of admission. This is a major sources of revenue – amounting in all, in 1967/8 to R315 lakhs, but the lion's share goes to municipalities, leaving about 20 per cent for the village authorities. There is good reason to believe that many entertainment organisers manage to avoid their liability for this tax.

(2) *Surcharges* which are apportioned among the three layers of Panchayati Raj:

(a) land revenue (cesses) levied and collected by the State (along with the principal land tax) and transferred without any deduction for overheads, the rate is Rs 0.18 per rupee of land revenue,

(b) stamp duty on transfers of immovable property; this is levied by the State on all transfers of property including sales, exchanges, gifts, mortgages with possession and leases in perpetuity. The rate is 5 per cent of the value of the transaction and is transferred to local authorities less 5 per cent for overheads. This source provides Gram Panchayats with some 14 per cent of their total revenue – (*vide* Table 1). The apportionment ratios are:

(i) for cesses – 5 Zillas: 6 Samithis: 7 Grams
(ii) for stamp duty – 1 Zilla: 1 Samithi: 3 Grams.

(3) *Grants-in-aid from the State*

Gram Panchayats are entitled to:

(a) a *per capita* general purposes grant of Rs 0.25,

(b) a compensatory grant of 50 per cent of extra expenditure involved in revised pay scales and allowances for ministry and other non-teaching personnel posted to villages,

(c) Incentive grants:

(i) for better performance in taxation collection, this is paid in accordance with a set scale;

---

[12] *Ibid.*, p. 67.

[13] *The A.P. Entertainments Tax Act*, 1939, *as amended by the Amendment Act*, 1965; Section 4.

(ii) cash prizes for a village excelling others in specified activities, eg, increased agricultural production, good public relations, successful enlistment campaign for the village volunteer force;

(iii) a bonus for unanimous elections to Village Councils was introduced in 1964 but not renewed for subsequent elections.

(d) *Panchayat Equalisation Fund.* The State has built up a fund from its own resources at the rate of Rs 0.25 *per capita.* It is utilised for assisting backward Gram Panchayats, through the agency of Zilla Parishads, for development purposes. Grants are made on a matching basis for such works as office buildings, primary school construction, drainage, etc. Loans are also made to village local authorities from this fund.

(e) *Loans.* Capital outlay of Gram Panchayats is partly met by loans granted by the State government. Although Gram Panchayats enjoy statutory power to raise loan capital on the open market also, in practice they are not permitted to do so. Instead, loans are granted to them by the State government itself at reasonable rates of interest, and these loans are usually long-term in nature. They are made under a scheme for "strengthening of Panchayats"; purposes include, the formation of village roads, construction of side drains, culverts, slaughter houses, cart and bus stations, shops, latrines, markets and office buildings. During the Third Five Year Plan period (1961/66), the aggregate loan capital granted to Gram Panchayats amounted to Rs. 38.54 lakhs[14]. In addition, a few Gram Panchayats are granted loans by the State Agricultural Department for the manufacture of compost. Further, a specified portion of the estimated cost of protected water supply schemes is also advanced by the State government on a loan basis to selected Gram Panchayats, the balance being met by way of grant.

Before proceeding to look at State assistance to the higher levels of local government, it may be helpful to comment at this stage on the incentive, grants and loans to Gram Panchayats which have been outlined above.

The grant offered for the display of better performance in tax collection does not seem to have met with any spectacular success, since the scheme suffers from many shortcomings. *First*, it does not offer any incentive to the Gram Panchayats to raise their existing tax rates to the optimum level. *Secondly*, it is not capable of inducing the Gram Panchayats to exploit their optional taxes. *Thirdly*, the rate of the grant is very low. *Fourthly*, since the grant is related to current taxes, it does not induce the Gram Panchayats to collect tax arrears. *Finally*, it offers scope for less scrupulous Gram Panchayats deliberately to reduce the tax base in such a way that the tax demand matches the collections, as the scheme does not prescribe any standard unit of tax demand below which collections should not fall in order to qualify for the grant.

---

[14] *Third Five Year Plan: Review of Progress, 1961-66, Andhra Pradesh* (Planning Department, Government of Andhra Pradesh, 1969), p. 314.

With regard to the incentive grant for unanimous elections offered in 1964 this landed the State government in a heavy financial commitment to the tune of Rs. 2 crores*. Unanimous election is in many cases no more than window-dressing; compromises are resorted to for the sake of expediency. After such elections, the old feuds and factions automatically reappear. This scheme seems to have been introduced after the elections were over[15], consequently, the grants offered by the State government were more a reward than an incentive. In reality a Government cannot "buy" worthwhile or lasting unanimity, especially when the personal rewards a chairmanship can confer outweigh the award of a grant to a particular institution. The State government has done well to dispense with the incentive grant offer for the 1970 elections.

The only grant which each Gram Panchayat is assured of annually is the *per capita* grant. The other grants listed are *ad hoc* in nature and benefit only a relatively small number of the many Gram Panchayats in the State. It is of course true that the Gram Panchayats suffer from serious financial difficulties, but they cannot disown their own share of responsibility for their sad plight. They have not adequately pulled their weight in tax effort. Their deep-seated reluctance and dogged opposition to exercise effectively their available tax powers, however meagre they seem to be, and their chronic inefficiency and inertia in tax collection are no less responsible for their indigence. They cannot place the onus of responsibility on the State Government for the payment of meagre grants, for it would be futile, if not foolhardy, to expect the State government to come to their rescue when they themselves fail to make any conscious and sincere effort to enlarge their own tax base. Nevertheless, there is no gainsaying the fact that Gram Panchayats do not receive support and assistance from the State to the extent that they rightfully deserve. Grants do not constitute a sufficiently appreciable proportion of their total receipts; in a majority of cases, they constitute less than 20 per cent.

Furthermore, examination of the loan finance of Gram Panchayats reveals that the volume of loan capital made available is insufficient if their most important needs are to be met. Added to this inadequacy, the annual assistance given by means of loans is unstable and often inordinately delayed. The loan policy of the State government lacks flexibility in the sense that in the matter of terms and conditions, both the poor and the well-off local units seem to have been treated alike. Discriminatory treatment in the grant of loans and favourable and liberal terms to poorly-endowed Gram Panchayats appears to be absent. Loans by the State government in many cases seem to have been based on political grounds rather than on the criteria of proven need. Finally, the Gram Panchayats have not made any conscious attempt to mobilise additional revenues of their own for liquidating their debts. This failure has often led to defaulting over the repayment of loans.

B. PANCHAYAT SAMITHIS. Unlike most other Indian States in Andhra Pradesh, a share in the land revenue is paid only to Panchayat Samithis in the form of a *per capita* grant on a varying basis, with the rate of the grant

*1 *crore* = 100 *lakhs*; 1 *lakh* = 100,000.—Ed.

[15]Elections were conducted in Mid-1964, while the grant was introduced in March 65 (GO MS No. 305 Panchayat Raj Dept. at 15/3/65).

and the level of development of each Block inversely related. It is a general purpose grant and is not tied to any specific activity. In the middle sixties budgets of individual Panchayat Samithis, the *per capita* grant constituted not more than 7 per cent of their total receipts[16]. The *per capita* rate is low and should be increased even by as much as 100 per cent or more. However, Panchayat Samithis are likely to receive a slightly bigger quantum from this source as a result of the 1971 decennial census.

As already stated, the proceeds of land/local cess and of the duty on transfers of immovable property are shared by all the three layers of Panchayati Raj in specified proportions. Samithis are entitled to a share of the land/local cess collected by the State government within their respective jurisdiction. Further, in Andhra area, the State government levies an additional cess (called *education cess*) on land revenue, the proceeds of which are transferred to Samithis on the basis of origin for the finance of elementary education[17].

In Andhra Pradesh, Samithis receive 1/5 of the net proceeds of the duty on transfers of property collected within their respective jurisdictions.

C. Zilla Parishads. Parishads in Andhra Pradesh are entitled to a share of 5/18 in the land/local cess levied and collected by the State Government. As a proportion of total receipts of Parishads, it does not average more than 5 per cent.

As regards the surcharge on Stamp duty, in Andhra Pradesh, as mentioned earlier, they are entitled to 1/5 of the duty on transfers of immovable property collected within their respective jurisdictions. The proceeds of the duty constitute not more than 5 per cent of the total receipts of the Parishads in the State.

D. Grants-in-Aid to Panchayat Samithis and Zilla Parishads. Grants are the prop which buttresses the entire edifice of Samithis and Parishads in the State without which their activities would undoubtedly grind to a halt. Indeed, these levels of Panchayati Raj depend heavily on ever-increasing, though never-satisfying, grants for their existence. Several crores of rupees are annually turned over to these bodies, the magnitude of which constitutes nearly one-third of the total budget estimates of the State government.

(1) *Incentive grants* to Samithis are made by the award of cash prizes for (i) good attendance at meetings and unanimity in decision-taking, (ii) good enrolment and attendances at schools, (iii) the number of literary centres and the number of adults who "pass out", and (iv) contributions towards works programmes and schemes sponsored by Samithis.

In 1964 grants for unanimous elections were also made on the lines of those described for Gram Panchayats.

No incentive grants are made to Zilla Parishads.

(2) *The Community Development programme* is concentrated only at the Samithi level. The expenditure incurred under the Programme is borne by the Union government to the extent of 75 per cent of the non-recurrent and

[16]Based on the author's study of the finances of 6 Samithis.

[17]*A.P. (Andhra Area) Elementary Education Act* 1920, Section 34 (2).

50 per cent of the recurrent costs, the balance being met by the State government. The C.D. grants, after excluding establishment provision, are made over to the Samithis on a varying *per capita* basis in inverse proportion to the level of development of each Block. The Tribal Blocks are entitled to an additional grant which is available for financing schemes of economic development, including social services.

(3) Samithis and Parishads also receive *grants* from government Departments for the finance of schemes transferred to them for execution[18]. Three-quarters of these grants relate to education and amount, in all, to not less than one-third of the total grants paid to the Panchayati Raj bodies in the State[19]. After education, the batting order of grants runs, in monetary terms, as follows: Agriculture, Social and Women Welfare, Medical and Public Health, Animal Husbandry, Industries and Fisheries.

(4) In addition, there are *direct grants* from the State Government which are made over for a variety of activities, among which communications (mostly for roads), minor irrigation, rural water supplies are important. Grants for establishment charges are also important. Grants for communications occupy an enviable place, next only to education grants, in the overall grant structure of Panchayati Raj bodies in the State. Moreover, honoraria to the Samithi Presidents and Parishad Chairmen, and travelling and "dearness" allowances to non-official members are also paid to these bodies by means of grants.

Most of the grants paid to the Panchayati Raj bodies are conditional and in many cases require a matching contribution from the people (the term "people's contribution" is deemed to include the contribution of the Gram Panchayats).

To deal with the quantitative importance of grants in the budgets of Panchayati Raj bodies in the State, it should be stated that in 1964-5 they constituted 74 and 70 per cent of the total receipts of Samithis and Parishads respectivelyss. Grants paid to Panchayati Raj bodies have risen sreadily, and as a percentage of the total developmental outlay of the State government, they accounted for 40 per cent in 1964-5. Today Andhra Pradesh is one of the few States where the size of the grants made to the Panchayati Raj bodies is really large.

In spite of a substantial growth in the quantum of grants the existing system of grants suffers from certain defects and complexities. In the first place, grants are paid to these bodies under some 100 different heads. Grants for the same activity are paid under different heads and routed through

---

[18]These Departments are Education, Agriculture, Medical and Public Health, Fisheries, Animal Husbandry, Industries, and Social and Women Welfare.

[19]This is due to the fact that the net cost of elementary and secondary education is borne by the State government.

[20]*Community Development and Panchayati Raj, Andhra Pradesh – Report for* 1964-5 (Panchayati Raj Department, Govt. of Andhra Pradesh, 1968), pp. 66 and 81.
The author's study of the finances of East Godavari and Srikakulam Zilla Parishads however shows that during the period 1960-1 to 1965-6, grants accounted for 80 and 86 per cent of their total receipts respectively.

different authorities, without any system of co-ordination. Secondly, the grants are released in instalments and these are again subject to inordinate delays. Thirdly, the quantum of assistance which the Panchayati Raj bodies are likely to get is uncertain and consequently their estimates are reduced to "paper" budgets. Fourthly, even after a decade's experience, the system of grants is not rationalised or systematised. The State government seems to be guided more by expediency considerations than by principles conducive to sound local finance. Finally, the matching grants offered for various developmental activities seems to have resulted in these bodies inflating their estimates in a significant number of cases. The so-called people's contribution which is insisted on for utilising the matching grants is in many cases borne by a newly-emerged cadre of contractors. Since payment for the execution of works is made after deducting the share of this contribution from their work bills, it has been reduced in practice to what can be called a "contractors' contribution". This has led to works undertaken by local authorities being rendered haphazard, inefficient and expensive.

Looking to the future, most of the activities of the Samithis and Parishads are bound to be grant-financed. It seems essential to constitute what may be called a "Panchayati Raj Grants Commission" at the State level which should periodically evaluate objectively the needs (and means, too) of the different layers of Panchayati Raj and make recommendations on the quantum of assistance which may have to be given to these bodies.

E. LOANS. Like Gram Panchayats, Samithis and Parishads are, in practice, not permitted to seek loan capital from the open market. Loans to these bodies are also granted by the State government itself for the construction of office, school and rural dispensary buildings, culverts, bridges, *etc.* During the Third Five Year Plan period, the State government advanced a sum of Rs. 10.93 lakhs as loans[21] – a sum which is certainly very low in relation to their needs. However, the volume of loan assistance which the State government can render is contingent upon its own financial ways and means, and its position here is a variable one. In view of the growing commitments of the State government, the loan assistance which it can give has had to remain meagre. As a result of the interplay of these factors, capital formation through loan-finance in the rural local government field is not significant.

It is relevant to mention here that Samithis and Parishads are also the agencies through which a number of loan funds are made available to individuals and institutions, mostly for agricultural purposes. The management of these loans has been unsatisfactory and many long term loans have now been withdrawn from their control and transferred to Land Mortgage Banks.

Search for New Revenue

This article has indicated how inadequate are the resources available for local authorities[22] with which to provide the services their citizens can properly expect, and the new works and services in the fields of economic

[21] *Third Five Year Plan: A Review of Progress, 1961-66. Op. cit.*, p. 314. Figures separately for Samithis and Parishads are unfortunately not available.
[22] See Table 3.

and social development required so as to raise the standard of living of the people. Can new sources be found?

While it seems impossible to discover and transfer from the State tax list any major tax source which is at once fiscally productive, locally feasible and administratively manageable, it seems logical to attempt to widen the narrow tax base of the Gram Panchayats in order to assure them of an additional core of finances.

Firstly, the Gram Panchayats are not statutorily empowered to levy a tax on livestock. The total livestock population in the State during 1966 stood at 3.16 *crores*[23] and not less than 90 per cent of this total was in the Panchayati Raj sector. This livestock can be brought onto the tax rolls of the Gram Panchayats. Even a small rate on this important form of readily-available wealth would produce substantial revenue to the local exchequer. If an obligatory tax were levied, it would be bound to prove next in importance only to house tax.

Secondly, the existing house tax does not cover non-agricultural vacant sites in the villages. A tax on these sites would enable Gram Panchayats, especially those situated just outside the rapidly-growing municipal areas, to tax gains accruing to the owner of a site which, by virtue of outside factors, may appreciate in value. It therefore seems essential to grant the Gram Panchayats power to levy these two taxes, making the former obligatory. In addition, there is a need to make the vehicle tax obligatory.

Owing to political considerations Panchayat Samithis have not exercised their power to levy a surcharge on Gram Panchayat taxes. The revenue is needed. How can they be persuaded to adopt a politically unpopular course? Perhaps the answer lies in indirect elections to Samithis, whereby Councillors would feel less under constraint to take necessary, if unpopular, decisions.

A useful revenue source would be to vest Samithis with the power to levy a surcharge on the State entertainments tax and if the State could surrender to Samithis its Show Tax presently levied on each cinema performance.

Zilla Parishads depend on grants for almost all their activities and it is difficult to suggest any tax which could be transferred to them by the State.

Conclusion

A number of Gram Panchayats do raise well over 50 per cent of their total revenue from the taxes they impose and other non-tax receipts that they collect. The author's own empirical study showed the proportion to vary from 35-85 per cent and overall in 1964/65 it was reckoned that about 65 per cent of[24] all Gram Panchayat income in the State was raised in this way.

Nevertheless, the overall picture which the author has presented does not show the financial position of Panchayati Raj bodies in Andhra Pradesh in a

---

[23] *Statistical Abstract of Andhra Pradesh*, 1969 (Bureau of Economics and Statistics Govt. of Andhra Pradesh, 1969), p. 106.

[24] Community Development & Panchayati Raj, *op. cit.*, pp. 56-59.

happy light. They have failed to mobilise their resources as well or as fully as they should. Dependence on State and Union Government grants has undermined their autonomy and made Samithi and Zilla Parishads operations akin to those of a government department. To maintain and receive the Panchayati system of democratic self-government, for the introduction of which India is justly proud, now calls for a really great effort at each level of local authority, with understanding support from State and Union Government, to mobilise effective financial resources, so as to bring the realities of development to the peoples of rural India.

TABLE I

RECEIPTS AND EXPENDITURE OF GRAM PANCHAYATS IN ANDHRA PRADESH DURING 1957-8 AND 1967-8

Item of Receipt/ Expenditure	1957-8		1967-8		
	Amount (in Rs.lakhs)	Per Cent	Amount (in Rs.lakhs)	Per Cent	Per (a) Capita Rs.
	Receipts				
House Tax	35.14	19.81	220.55	28.59	0.72
Profession Tax ..	4.50	2.54	17.70	2.29	0.06
Vehicle Tax.. ..	2.79	1.57	9.93	1.29	0.03
Sub Total	42.43	23.92	248.18	32.17	0.81
Duty on transfers of property	33.96	19.15	110.62	14.34	0.36
Other receipts including grants (b) ..	100.98	56.93	412.52	53.49	1.34
Total Receipts ..	177.37	100.00	771.32	100.00	2.51
	Expenditure				
Sanitation	19.13	11.33	82.04	13.39	0.27
Street lighting ..	12.07	7.15	43.11	7.03	0.14
Water Supply ..	15.25	9.03	56.67	9.25	0.18
Public utility works including remunerative enterprises ..	45.54	26.97	168.86	27.53	0.55
Other expenditure ..	76.85	45.52	262.44	42.79	0.85
Total expenditure ..	168.83	100.00	613.32	100.00	1.99

Note: (a) According to 1961 census figures.

(b) Breakdown figures are not available.

Source: Andhra Pradesh State Administration Reports, 1964-5 *and* 1967-8.

TABLE 2

ANNUAL RECEIPTS OF GRAM PANCHAYATS IN ANDHRA PRADESH DURING 1966-7

Annual Receipts	Gram Panchayats	
	Number	Per cent
Up to Rs. 1,000	3,383	22.16
Above Rs. 1,000 but below Rs. 3,000 ..	6,797	44.52
Above Rs. 3,000 but below Rs. 5,000 ..	2,597	17.01
Above Rs. 5,000 but below Rs. 10,000 ..	1,557	10.20
Above Rs. 10,000	932	6.11
Total	15,266	100.00

Source: Andhra Pradesh State Administration Report, 1966-7, p. 175.

TABLE 3

FINANCIAL POSITION OF PANCHAYATI RAJ BODIES IN ANDHRA PRADESH IN 1964-65

	Gram Panchayats	Panchayat Samithis	Zilla Parishads
Number of Units in the State	15,270	321	20
Tax Revenue in Rs. Lakhs ..	169	.70	nil
Tax Revenue Per Capita – Rupees	0.55	"trace"	nil
Total Revenue – Rs. Lakhs ..	577	2,101	1,694
Total Revenue Per Capita – Rupees	1.88	6.71	5.62
Total Expenditure – Rs. Lakhs	549	2,024	1,534
Expenditure Per Capita – Rupees	1.78	6.46	4.90
Taxation Revenue as a percentage of Expenditure and Revenue	30.80	0.03	nil

Source: *Community Development and Panchayati Raj Report for* 1964/5, pp. 57, 82.

Land Tenure and Size of Holdings — towards a new strategy for economic studies in tenancy farming in the Gezira Scheme [1]

By TAHA EL JACK TAHA

Mr. Taha is Senior Development Officer, Sudan Gezira Board.

THE Land Tenure System in the Gezira Scheme was treated in a paper entitled "Land Tenure System in the Gezira Scheme" contributed by the writer to the Annual Agricultural Meeting held at Barakat Headquarters on 22 February 1966.

The appendix to that paper showed the continuous sub-division of the standard 40-Feddan* holding which had been adopted at the inception of the Scheme as the optimum size for the cropping and fallowing systems then prevailing – determined as they were by the watering regime, crop sanitation practices and the replenishment of nitrogen in the soil.

The sub-division of the 40-Fedd. standard Gezira holdings in the 1966 survey gave the following distribution:

	No, of Tenants	5 *Fedds. and under*	5-9 *Fedds.*	10-19 *Fedds.*	20 *Fedds. and over*
Gezira ..	33726	19287	1966	11872	601
Managil ..	42278	34118	1720	5821	619
Total ..	76004	53405	3686	17693	1220

Percentage composition by size of holdings in the Gezira/Managil Scheme (1966):

	5 *Fedds. and under* per cent	*Over* 5-9 *Fedds.* per cent	10-19 *Fedds.* per cent	20 *Fedds. and over* per cent
Gezira	57	6	35	2
Managil	81	4	14	1
Gez/Man ..	69	5	24.5	1.5

[1] This article is based on a paper presented at the Annual Agricultural Meeting, Agric. Research Corporation, Wad Medani – Democratic Republic of the Sudan. May 15, 1972.

*One Feddan = 1.038 *acres*.—Ed.

**The sub-divisions refer to areas planted to Cotton.

The composition by size of Holdings in the Gezira/Managil Scheme in the 1971/72 season reads as follows:

Group	*5 Fedds. and under*	*5-9 Fedds.*	*10-19 Fedds.*	*20 Fedds. and over*	*No. of Tenants*
Gezira ..	30600	5752	9604	314	46270
Managil ..	38723	2818	5435	305	47281
Total Gezira/ Managil	69323	8570	15039	619	93551*

Percentage composition by size of Holdings 1971/72 season**

Group	*5 Fedds. and under*	*5-9 Fedds.*	*10-19 Fedds.*	*20 Fedds. and over*	
Gezira		66	12	21	1
Managil		82	6	11	1
Gezira/Managil		74	9	16	1

The composition by size of Holdings in the Gezira Scheme resulting from the sub-division of the standard 40 Feddans holding deserves consideration for a number of reasons:

(a) There has always been a tendency to consider the success of the Gezira Scheme in terms of agricultural output and productivity from a national and not from an individual tenant's point of view. Hence global production figures always reigned supreme in any report or accounts analysis sheet.

(b) There is no doubt that such considerations are essential for the evaluation of the performance of the Scheme with its leading role in the national production sector; but there should be plenty of room for considering the point of view of individual tenant-farmers. This microscopic view of agricultural holdings gives support to the concept of agricultural holdings as production units rather than administrative units in a land distribution scheme. Furthermore, this view lays emphasis on the economic factors of production at work in every single holding – land, labour and capital. It is also concerned with the proper size of holdings, the amount of labour which can be economically employed, viz. family and hired labour or machinery and the extent to which production requisites can best be brought into operation.

(c) In the Gezira Scheme reference is invariably made to the size of holding in terms of the cotton land being the principal crop so far, but this conception is now repudiated in some circles in view of the specialisation in crop production which is remunerative on small holdings, such as vegetable growing, dairy farming and poultry enterprises, especially when there are markets close at hand.

**The total number of tenants shown reflects the increase between 1967 and 1970 of new tenants added to the scheme, as against the figure of 76004 for 1966.*—Ed.

***The sub-divisions refer to areas planted to cotton.

(d) Gezira/Managil tenant-farmers are heterogenous as regards education, managerial ability and responsiveness to modern technology. Furthermore, this heterogeniety gained momentum through the traditional land tenure which was prevailing before the Scheme began and through top priority in the allocation of holdings being given originally to the leading land owners. This privileged position gave them much easier access to production requisites than the other categories of tenant-cultivators could obtain.

(e) The increasing absenteeism among tenant-cultivators in recent years which amounted to 51 per cent in Shawal Extension (Kuwait Block*) Mangil area in 1968/69 season points unmistakably to the fact that tenant-cultivators especially those on small holdings (5 Fedds. and less in cotton) are compelled to seek additional employment in order to maintain themselves and their families. There are cases of such small holders working on a part-time basis as wage earners on large holdings or selling their labour to the industrial or services or transport sectors; of some working as petty traders in local markets or in the retail trade in the three towns, Khartoum, Omdurman and Khartoum North; of others engaged in the traditional local handicraft trades which need to be developed.

(f) The pressure of population in the irrigated area recorded in the last population census at a figure of 880,000 is now estimated to have reached 1,250,000. This alarming population explosion compels planners to take note and to seek a means of finding gainful employment for job-seekers. The sub-division of holdings which recorded an overall increase of 5 per cent in the 1971/72 survey over the 1964/65 figure recorded in February 1966, points to the danger of an expansion of existing holdings at the cost of displacing people from the land without having any means of absorbing them in the industrial and services sectors in the urban centres.

(g) The intensification and diversification policy was introduced by the Sudan Gezira Board by stages as part of a plan for the utilisation of land and water resources brought about by the conclusion of the Nile Waters Agreement between the Sudan and Egypt in 1959, and preparatory to the construction of Roseires Dam (the first stage of which was completed in January 1967) to impound 2.7 milliard cubic metres of water. The rising percentage of intensified and diversified cropping in the Gezira Scheme for the years 1962/63 to 1971/72 can be summarised as follows: The total cropped area of the Gezira Scheme rose in the decade 1962/71 from 433,200 feddan to 828,150 feddan with the gross rotational area rising from under 950,000 to nearly 1,200,000 feddan, i.e. from 46 per cent a rise to 69.5 per cent of the land actually being cropped. Of the total area cotton occupied a fairly constant proportion around 25 per cent, but other crops rose from 21 per cent to 44 per cent and this accounts for the greater land usage and consequent greater productivity. Durra with nearly 19 per cent, Wheat over 10 per cent, Groundnut with 6 per cent and Vegetables with over 2½ per cent are the principal "other" crops.

**Administrative divisions in each area are described as "blocks".*—Ed.

(h) The intensification and diversification of cropping is one of several ways to increase the productivity of an agricultural holding of fixed land area. Other practical ways could be summarised as follows:

i. Departure from the prevailing monoculture and the adoption of double cropping or specialisation on intensive livestock and horticultural production. The greater intensification and diversification of crop and animal production will enable tenant-cultivators and family and hired labour to be more regularly engaged and their work load spread more evenly over the year thereby reducing unemployment and underemployment.

ii. More intensive cultivation could be practiced by using more irrigation water and fertilisers.

iii. Additional water and a departure from the prevailing monoculture through intensive growing of legumes will improve the fertility of the soil.

(i) There has been a continuous debate on whether the small or large agricultural holding is the more productive. Hence the importance of economic studies in tenancy farming to gather data over a period of years on a large number of representative sample holdings before final judgement can be passed.

(j) The further improvement of agricultural holdings is made possible through the conduct of semi-detailed soil surveys by the Soil Survey Department and by the classification of soils into the various land classes and according to the various productivity ratings. In this connection the tenant-cultivator can avoid wasted effort on unproductive land and encouraged instead to invest in a land improvement programme with every prospect of recouping all expenses assisted by long-term leases and secure land tenure.

The investment in the semi-detailed soil surveys entrusted to the soil Survey Department at Wad Medani, the launching of a scheme for the improvement of minor canalisation and drains in the Gezira irrigated area by the Ministry of Irrigation and Hydro Electric Power, the fertiliser demonstrations and Pilot Schemes programme whose commencement is conditional on a positive word from a donor country or agency, the proposed precision levelling programme, should all be considered as aspects of the improvement of agricultural holdings aimed at the achievement of the economic and social welfare of the tenant-cultivators and the provision of incentives to intensify land use and increase agricultural productivity. As and when these projects are realised, among some of the benefits should be:

i. a more efficient use of irrigation water.

ii. A greater opportunity for the introduction of mechanisation where there is a definite advantage in doing so.

iii. A reduction in the area used for roads, irrigation ditches, etc., thereby devoting more areas to crop production and livestock and poultry enterprises.

iv. Making fields more accessible for agricultural operations, and the collection and marketing of crops.

The Present Technique of Agricultural Data Collection

Agricultural data collection dates back to the beginning of the Gezira Scheme. The data contained in agricultural reports of the Sudan plantations syndicate and its successor the Sudan Gezira Board were based mostly on eye estimates by field inspectors, group inspectors and Samads (agricultural overseers). The agricultural reports accumulating over the years were not analysed and this was due to a lack of agricultural statistics and analysis services.

The promotion of agricultural data collection on a random-sampling basis came as a result of the activities of the agricultural statistics section of the Ministry of Agriculture in the early Nineteen Sixties. The Sudan Gezira Board took the initiative by setting up an economic survey unit within its development branch as a nucleus for a fully-fledged agricultural economics and statistics department. In the 1965/66 season which witnessed the birth of the Unit, crop cutting and cost of production surveys covered one block in the Gezira Centre Group concentrating on wheat only. In the following season the wheat crop grown in three blocks was covered by the survey. In the subsequent years 1967/68, 68/69, 69/70 and 70/71, the survey was extended to cover two Blocks per Group in the Gezira Scheme covering 10 tenants per Block randomly selected and three crops, Dura, Groundnuts and Wheat were sampled.

In the 1970/71 season and by agreement with the Head, Department of Agricultural Economics and Statistics, Ministry of Agriculture, the Sudan Gezira Board employed its own team of field supervisors and enumerators on a yearly basis. In the 1971/72 season, the activities of the Economic Surveys Unit were extended to cover the remaining crops of cotton, vegetables, fodder. However, the extensive nature of the surveys means the collection of a vast amount of data the analysis of which is now presenting a formidable problem. The Sudan Gezira Board's approval of the creation of a post of a statistician trainee should prove of considerable assistance here.

The Economic Surveys Unit has accumulated interesting data and built up useful experience which could readily be placed at the disposal of field inspectors, extension Officers and tenants. Furthermore, the Unit is quite prepared to hold field demonstrations for the benefit of members of the Agricultural Staff who are expected to take part in future surveys of crop cutting, production costs and tenancy farming.

Criticism has been levelled at the agricultural statistics approach strictly followed over the past seven years in the collection of production data on crop yields and costs in the Gezira Scheme. The following are among the reasons put forward:

(a) The area sampled represents two plots in a small randomly selected area only[2]. There is thus the danger of unreliable results from possibly

[2]The economic surveys of the past seven years were based on two small areas – one-sixtieth part of a Feddan each per holding, randomly selected. But as from the 1972-73 season, the samples now represent the different sizes of holdings randomly selected and the surveys cover all the different enterprises in the holding from seed-bed preparation to planting, harvesting and marketing of crops, as explained later in this article.

atypical soils, unreliable also where the yield cost figures are worked out from 1/60 part of a Feddan to arrive at the figures of one Feddan, for the whole area surveyed and for the cropped area of the particular crop in the whole Scheme.

(b) The techniques in use rely solely on plots which are randomly selected and on questionnaires completed by tenant-cultivators which strain the accuracy of their memories long after the operations were carried out thereby giving a data of low reliability.

(c) Lack of proper recording of all the agricultural activities in the holding surveyed from seed-bed preparation right through to harvest, assembly and delivery to markets.

The New Strategy

The Economic Surveys Unit of the Sudan Gezira Board is indebted to the Agricultural Economics and Statistics Department of the Ministry of Agriculture for its continuous support without which it would have been difficult for it to carry out its full programme of work.

The secondment of the field officers, supervisors and enumerators during the years 1965/66 – 1969/70 enabled the Unit to operate and build up a cadre of trained men who are now keeping the Unit going.

The 1972/73 season will witness a turning-point in the history of the Economic Surveys Unit in the Gezira Scheme because attention will be focused on a sample of agricultural holdings randomly selected from the six groups comprising the Gezira irrigated area at the rate of two blocks per group and ten tenant-cultivators per block. The underlying purpose of this shift in emphasis is to determine co-efficients which will be useful in agricultural development planning.

The sample of holdings will be representative of the different sizes prevailing in the Gezira Scheme. The selected tenant-cultivators will be visited at weekly intervals for the duration of the full agricultural season. Care will be taken to record the various enterprises on each agricultural holding which will make the data analysis and economic evaluation a fairly straightforward task.

By kind courtesy of the Agricultural Economics & Statistics Department of the Ministry of Agriculture, F.A.O., production economist and farm management specialist, Mr. K. H. Friedrich, visited the Gezira Scheme at the beginning of March, 1972, and conferred with the staff of the Economic Surveys Unit at their Barakat Headquarters. He availed himself of the opportunity to present his "Manual for Farm Management Investigations in Developing Countries" for discussion and critical comment by the members. However, the manual was well received and certain adjustments to the questionnaire forms used by the Economic Surveys Unit were made in the light of the Manual. The coding system for the various agricultural activities

which will be followed as from 1972/73 will help in computer processing when this is introduced at a later date. A further benefit accruing from Mr. K. H. Friedrich's visit to Gezira will be to strengthen the links between the Sudan and the F.A.O., which will lead to exchanges of views and data and training opportunities for the staff of the Economic Surveys Unit in Farm Management at the Torino Training Centre and to mutually arranged regional Seminars.

Conclusions

The decreasing size of the agricultural holdings in the Gezira Scheme has to be buttressed by supporting services supplying fresh knowledge about improved agricultural production methods, improved seeds, fertilisers, credit and marketing. For, despite the reduced size of agricultural holdings, output should be raised nonetheless by an increased intensity of land use by way of year-round irrigation which will be available on the replacement of the old sluice gates of Seminar presently being undertaken by the Ministry of Irrigation.

Effective participation of tenant-cultivators' associations and co-operatives is needed to effect the planned improvements to agricultural holdings through increased efficiency in marketing and provision of agricultural supplies. An Agricultural Credit system is needed whereby the input requirements of modern technology can be obtained – low interest rates on the loans may increase inefficient use of credit.

Agricultural Extension and demonstration work should be encouraged on tenant-cultivators' own land thereby providing the latter with the results of recent research findings and improved technology.

Economic studies in tenancy farming should cover marketing, prices, income, expenditure analysis and existing agricultural institutions. Prices for agricultural products must be high enough to cover adequately the cost of inputs, e.g. improved seeds, fertilisers, pesticides and other materials in order to make the use of these inputs profitable. Furthermore, tenant-cultivators must have sufficient income or access to sufficient credit to cover the cost of improved agricultural techniques.

The need for close liaison between the Economic Surveys Unit and similar Units in other sectors of the economy once they are established at industrial research centres in the country should be stressed, for agricultural development plans should be closely co-ordinated with industrial development plans. After all, agriculture and industry compete for resources. Labour needed by the industrial sector has to come from the agricultural sector and their release depends on the absorptive capacity of the rising industries on the one hand and the increasing productivity of agriculture on the other to feed a rising urban population and provide raw materials for the industry.

The operation of the Economic Surveys Unit of the Sudan Gezira Board

for several years on the lines described in this paper, hand-in-hand with the Agricultural Economics and Statistics Department of the Ministry of Agriculture and other Economic Survey Units to be set up in other large-scale agricultural schemes in the Democratic Republic of the Sudan on the one hand and the Agricultural and Industrial Research Centres on the other is essential for agricultural development planning.

This integrated approach to agricultural development planning and programming for the modification of land tenure and agricultural institutions will, it is confidently expected, lead to the boosting of agricultural productivity for the welfare and prosperity of tenant-cultivators and the whole nation.

The Effectiveness of Consultants in the Developing World

By JOHN SARGENT

Mr. Sargent is Director, Overseas Services Unit, Royal Institute of Public Administration.

WHILE certain types of technology and experience are not available in developing countries, there will be a need for consultants on management and in many of the professional skills. Whether firms of consultants or individuals are recruited by the technical assistance agencies, the success of consultancy largely depends on the quality of the individual. These individuals, apart from knowing their particular job, need to identify and believe in the general aims of the developing country, and have genuine sympathy with its political attitudes and general aims. They need to have a determination to succeed and to overcome the many frustrations, broken appointments and staff transfers that threaten progress made on the project. If the key Minister or official with necessary authority is not available as arranged, then the consultant must wait – or try again; he must be flexible and grab every opportunity to implement his proposals as they are agreed and not expect perfection in a single step.

If these qualities and skills are required of consultants overseas, there needs to be considerable concentration on the methods of recruitment and acceptance of the principle that first, rather than second-class people, are expected for this type of work, and this means attractive conditions of employment in return for disciplined performance.

Period of Contract

There is a considerable time wastage when consultants take up appointments overseas on one or two year contracts. The selected consultant has to secure accommodation for himself and his family, arrange for the children to attend a local school and he must learn in detail the demands of his work. Months have passed by the time he has settled down to the assignment for which he was engaged. His family should then have recovered from various minor ailments induced by climate change and have survived the excitement and novelty of seeing the more obvious local attractions. Long before the term is over the consultant is beginning to look ahead to his next appointment, and is making arrangements for the despatch of his family with all the necessary correspondence that is involved with the letting of property, the sale of effects, re-housing and the selection of new schools for the children. If one adds to this the inevitable hazard of selecting an effective consultant with the right experience and the strain of matching him to the tasks and environment, one realises that the impact on the client can be seriously diluted.

Many international agencies offer a single year of consultancy with no guarantee of continuation, and settle therefore for seven months' work for a year's salary and expenses. If one extends the consultants' contracts to two years, the domestic worries and time spent on future appointments obviously occupies a smaller proportion of the contract time. Although larger contracts may be of more assistance to the Government receiving aid, even two years constitute a serious interruption to the normal career pattern of the consultant. Experience suggests that apart from a small number of qualified people who have just reached or are about to reach retirement age, many of those accepting appointments in developing countries are inexperienced and on the threshold of their careers. This often causes disappointment at the receiving end because inevitably a number of these comparatively junior advisors may not be able to contribute as much from their academic-based backgrounds as would be the case if they undertook such consultancy in mid-career. With certain promotion and opportunities for professional work in his own country, the mid-career man rarely wishes to interrupt his normal life and that of his family to undergo two years' work overseas. If he is willing to do so, his price is justifiably high. Many of those applying for posts may be doing so, partly because of their comparative lack of successs in their own country, so that the final choice is sometimes made from a short-list of second-rate personnel. When assessing the cost of consultancy, there is a tendency to consider the basic air fare from home to the employing country as a major factor. Salaries, superannuation and subsistence charges together with family allowances in fact make the air fare of minor importance. Rather than waste too much time in orientation and settling dependents, it would often be better were the consultant flown out at planned intervals to give advice and participate in projects without the handicap of family or a career problem. Often when one first arrives in a developing country, essential recommendations and certainly many decisions can only be made after data is gathered, when statistical returns are completed and reports from outlying districts read.

Selecting Consultants

Whether consultants come from commercial firms, from governments, universities or international agencies, often depends on the expertise required and the general context of the mission. It does not follow that individual consultants are always worthy custodians of the reputation earned by their employing organisations, and it is horrifying to learn that some developing countries receive consultants from reputable sources and put them in key positions with only second-hand knowledge of the individual selected. Even if the individual consultant comes from a "safe stable", there are a number of reasons why he may not necessarily respond effectively to local conditions once he takes up duty overseas.

He will need to be all the things mentioned in the introduction and also aware of the social, religious, geographical and economic problems he will meet. He must be in excellent health; he must possess communication skills, a thorough appreciation of the behavioral sciences and more than a touch of humility. His health check should cover not only the normal physical require-

ments, but any suspicion of neurosis must be spotted together with any strange traits such as a tendency to alcoholism or other personal weaknesses.

Nor can the selection for some posts rest entirely on a thorough examination of the consultant himself. If his wife is to accompany him, she also must share his general views, be physically fit and appreciate the sort of work her husband is about to undertake. Only then will she realise that her role is a supporting and sometimes lonely one with all the temptations of idleness and a strange environment. She must also consider the possibilities of domestic and child care problems that go with living in a strange climate and a different social setting. Anyone who has worked overseas could quote cases where the work of an excellent consultant has been in jeopardy because of the nagging of an impatient or lonely wife or through problems that have overshadowed the consultant and ruined his professional reputation.

There are some who resent delving into the family life of people selected. In normal selection circumstances one might agree, but when sending expensive consultants half way across the world for a year or two to undertake duties in difficult circumstances, one should not underestimate the handicap that can arise if one disregards the consultant's family. The normal outlets for leisure and particularly for those with an interest in social or political work are limited in many overseas posts, and contact with the local population is not easily pursued unless consultants' wives have the right attitude not only to the country and people they are visiting, but also understand the work their husbands undertake. The problems are even more difficult if the consultant team itself is an international one. Within a project team, national groups form rivalries, face language problems and minor differences take on disproportionate dimensions. It is, therefore, wise when building a team to take some note of the mix of nationalities involved in the hope that consultants from a variety of backgrounds will blend into an effective task force.

Staccato Consultancy

If the consultant knows what by way of data he is likely to want, much of his preliminary work can be put in hand following a brief survey, during which time the consultant can return home to his normal task. Whilst undertaking the preliminary survey he should assist with the selection of at least two counterparts for training and, if necessary, take them back with him to his own country and start to train them within his own organisation or at least under his supervision. This needs to be organised within the technical or political context of the client department in the developing country, so that when he returns with his trained counterparts he is able to make an effective start on the project. This saves time and the consultant should by then be beginning to build an indigenous nucleus to work with him and offer continuity to the project when his contract ends. He should return for periods at later stages for consultation, and to arrange for further people to be trained overseas as he will need to expand the number of his support staff, so that even if counterparts are transferred to other work, the project does not falter for lack of key staff committees for some years to that project.

This staccato or spaced approach to consultancy will, of course, only work if the whole scheme is fully backed and under the direct responsibility of a local minister or official of the highest rank to prevent loss of impetus and ensure continuity.

Individual consultants may also be linked through their employing organisation with other experts who can play their part in the project at various intervals, so providing a group effort, maintaining a standard attitude and approach to problems, and a better chance of continuity. This group consultancy minimises the wastage of consultants' time as families need not accompany them, and gives a hallmarked backing from the parent organisation employing the consultants. If on an initial visit one particular consultant does not meet local requirements, a discreet reshuffle of the personnel available can sometimes produce a suitable replacement without the embarrassment of dismissing an individual consultant and starting the selection process all over again with considerable expense and anxiety for the project. To a limited degree the Royal Institute of Public Administration has successfully tried out this type of consultancy as also have some of the universities and international firms of consultants who have established working links with the developing world. Experts or resource personnel are not easily seconded at short notice from their desks, but a panel of people organised to play a part within a clearly defined framework can be built up. Although the air fares and subsistence rates of short-term mobile consultants are not insignificant, they are small when considering the total cost of a one-year consultant. The time wasted overseas is minimised, family expenses cut, and qualified consultants in the prime of their careers may be attracted to this kind of work without serious interruption to their normal professional careers. The method also encourages local counterparts to accept responsibility for the continuity and progress of the project which is ideal as a training concept.

The criteria used to judge the effectiveness of consultants in public administration or management may not apply when considering consultants, say, in the engineering, agricultural or technical fields, where projects need closer supervision and the training of counterparts is often a much longer process. Even then it might be worth considering whether more frequent visits of shorter duration would be cheaper, and the professional training could well be commenced before the consultant has reached a vital stage in the assignment.

Failure has sometimes been due to reluctance to set aside adequate support staff within the client department which has caused both the consultant and his counterparts to spend too much time on researching or minor duties rather than developing the main ideas and getting to grips, at top management level, with the implementation of recommendations. Recent experience in building up management services personnel in three developing countries suggests the necessity for having a large cadre of support staff. When first broached to top civil servants in the countries concerned, they feared extravagance, but after three or four years of experience the bolder approach was soon to justify the higher initial investment in skilled manpower.

The Commercial Consultant and Overseas Governments

The contribution of business consultants has tended to be minimised as far as public service is concerned, either on the ground of high expense or because of unfamiliarity with the government context. Thus the mistakes of consultants have often been publicised whilst their excellent advice has been kept in confidential files. When it comes to re-organising a public authority or creating an organisation that will deal with the many services for which governments are responsible, the local internal staff sometimes lack the experience, objectivity or skills necessary. Even in the rare instances where a Management Services Division has been built up, there will be occasions when the Government is completely re-organised, as when central government for economic or political reasons takes over what in many countries would be the private sector of industry or commerce. It is on these occasions that the permanent management services teams can be augmented by skilled consultants and, since their engagement is likely to operate for only a short time, the cost may not be significant. In fact, when one thinks of the research and supporting services built up by the reputable consultant firms, the price, although appearing to be high, is in fact reasonable. There could be even more co-operation with consultants if the rather artificial and so-called ethical reluctance of consultants to advertise was to some extent overcome, and frank explanations given as to why the fees charged appear to be higher than the cost of experts to the permanent staff.

Consultants and Training

Wherever possible there must be forged the closest possible link between the consultant in the field and the sources of training he is using for developing counterpart and support staff. From time to time the wrong man will be chosen for detailed training, but the danger to the project will be minimised if the consultant knows exactly what training the indigenous staff will be asked to undergo, and if he has some control over that training. Far too many counterpart staff are sent away to courses not designed for their purpose and so have to gather what they can from standard courses in the blind hope that the ultimate mix of experience gained will add to the preparation for the task ahead. This approach is invariably wasteful, and it would be far better for the consultant on site to use his own department or a training centre known to him even if this has a narrowing effect on the tuition. At least what training is done will be directional and likely to be more effective. Any case studies used could then be designed to fit the realistic working environment and training projects created in a working context to simulate the conditions and problems the trainees will have to face on their return home.

To make this possible it is necessary for training consultants to spend some time in client departments and, before they design courses, to become acquainted with the overseas conditions and prepare to overcome any resistance to change when students return to their duties. The task of selling training objectives to top management by discussion and by appreciation conferences should parallel the basic training courses which otherwise will tend to take place in a vacuum and results cannot be expected to be spectacular.

All too often the returned trainee is virtually forbidden to implement ideas gathered on courses. These training support aspects of a consultant's role may be expensive but should not be regarded as a luxury but as an investment with the reward of increased implementation.

Evaluation

A difficulty with a great deal of work undertaken by consultants overseas has been overcoming the problem of "follow-up". The real test of effective consultancy is to see whether the organisation is in fact providing the services or maintaining the services set up with the help of consultants without depending too much on external help. Only in this way can the effects of advice, the provision of equipment and the training of indigenous staff be assessed. When preparing contracts it is often well worth the extra expense of arranging for a follow-up visit a year or two after completion to tighten up procedures or answer questions raised by counterparts who are grappling with the new organisation. Such advice may be administrative or technical but will often be best directed towards backing up the service provided with reserve staff and improving local training. Officials or managers groomed for these tasks as counterparts are apt to be promoted to other jobs and not replaced quickly enough with consequent failure of the new services provided. There are many examples of this failure when it has been necessary to revert to the employment of ex-patriate staff. Progress is also held up while a second wave of counterparts and their supporters are trained. It is far better for consultants to check these tendencies before they happen – and all for the cost of an air fare and a few days subsistence.

Quarterly Notes

EAST AFRICA – *The East African Community Management Institute*

The Management Institute will be housed in a complex of attractive, yet functional, buildings on Njiro Hill, Arusha, Tanzania. The site, comprising 50 acres, has been presented by the Arusha Town Council.

The buildings will provide residential accommodation for 120 persons, in surroundings conducive to study. They possess flexible facilities to fit groups ranging in size from 10 to 350, depending on the training or conference activity being conducted. Training methods will be highly participative, and provision is made for the installation of the whole range of modern training aids, including audio-visual apparatus such as closed circuit TV and a small computer terminal where managers can practice computer assisted problem analysis.

The library will, in its initial stage, hold up to 10,000 books (together with a wide range of periodicals) in such fields as transport unit operations and management techniques, organisation development, road, rail, air, posts and tele-communication development, and East African sociology and economics.

Situated with splendid views of Mount Meru, Mount Kilimanjaro and the plains, and near to the Kilimanjaro International Airport, the Institute should prove most suitable for the training, conference, research and consulting purposes of a modern management centre.

The foundation stone of the Institute was formally laid on 3 December 1971 by the President of Tanzania.

A specially convened working conference decided that the functions of the Institute shall be:

(a) To provide facilities for the study of, and to conduct training in, the principles, procedures and techniques of business and public administration and management, staff management and organisation development and such other related subjects as the Governing Council may determine, with particular emphasis on the management of the Community and its corporations;

(b) To provide management consultancy services;

(c) To sponsor or conduct research relating to the matters referred to above;

(d) To conduct courses and examinations leading to professional qualifications in management and to grant diplomas, certificates or other awards of the Institute;

(e) To sponsor, organise and provide facilities for conferences and seminars.

The operations of the Institute will not clash or overlap with the activities of other management development institutions in the Partner States, but close co-operation and collaboration will be maintained with these training centres.

The conference made recommendations for a Governing Council which will have general direction and control of the Institute. Ex-officio members of the Governing Council will include the Secretary-General of the East African Community (Chairman), the Directors-General of the Corporations and the Director of the Institute. Other Council members will include the Representative of the Community's General Fund Services and three members from the Partner States chosen for their experience in education or management development, or consultancy or research.

The working conference considered estimates of expenditure for the years 1972 to 1975. The annual average operating cost is US $378.470 exclusive of the costs of the international staff which will continue to be met by the United Nations. The General Fund Services of the Community are expected to contribute 45 per cent of the budget. The other users, the East African Corporations and Associated companies, are expected to contribute 55 per cent. Other East African bodies utilising the services of the Institute may pay economic fees as determined by the Governing Council.

To make legal proposals for the establishment, control financing and administration of the Institute, a bill has been drafted by the Legal Counsel of the Community for presentation to the February 1973 meeting of the East African Legislative Assembly.

Source: UN Public Administration Newsletter No. 48

UNITED NATIONS – *Law as an instrument of reform*

Major administrative reforms often required the enactment of laws. In a legal system, laws were juridical acts (second only to the constitution) through which the public authorities adapted the instruments of State action to the aims of development policies. Accordingly, the initiation and implementation of major administrative reform often took the form of the promulgation of laws and their implementation.

For political and other reasons, however, the field of law – both in States with a written constitution and in States that have a constitution based on custom – had been determined by quite other reasons than the demands of administrative reforms. One of those reasons was the desire to ensure that the guarantee of the law should be applied to the rights of the individual and, to that extent, it could constitute an obstacle to administrative reforms. In other words, the law often fulfilled a function of protecting established rights and interests, and could thus constitute an obstacle to administrative reforms. It could also be an obstacle to the extent that the need to have recourse to law in order to carry out a reform involved the operation of the legislative procedure, which by nature was a long process.

During the long legislative process, government projects could be distorted by the interplay of party politics, pressure groups and the weight of public opinion, which might not fully realise what changes were needed. Furthermore, once established, laws would be difficult to amend as they would set up vested interests. The use of "skeleton law" was indicated as a possible solution to the question of delay. Since the technical detail was often closely linked to the general purpose the formulation of a *loi cadre* enabled a Government both to reveal its plan in full and to enjoy the advantages of the legislative process, while retaining the relative ease, flexibility and speed with which to apply the principles voted on.

The concrete application of important administrative reforms would be doubtful if the proposed objects failed to enjoy the support of the parties and important groups, such as trade unions, and the fullest participation of the legislatures and the general population.

Source: Report of the UN inter-regional Seminar on major administrative reforms in developing countries, held at Falmer, Brighton, Oct./Nov. 1971.

INTERNATIONAL – *Disaster Relief by Satellite*

The 1970 earthquake in Peru cost 50,000 lives. Some months later the cyclone-tidal wave, in what is now Bangladesh, caused an estimated half million deaths.

Most disaster-prone zones fall within developing countries. They lack the surplus resources needed to organise relief work quickly. And their economic development can be severely retarded; in the Asian typhoon area, for example, losses sometimes total 5 per cent of gross national product.

Usually, communications to, from and within the stricken area, often limited at the best of times, are obliterated. Days, and sometimes weeks, may pass before the scale of the tragedy, and the urgent needs it has created, are known.

This immediate post-disaster period is crucial in two ways. First, more people may die then than were killed outright in the disaster itself. Second, a quick, clear idea of what is needed is essential.

Rapid, accurate communications are the first essential. With a $50,000 UNDP grant, ITU has been assessing the rich possibilities of satellites.

The ITU system would work with satellites on geo-stationary orbits – that is, revolving at the same speed as the earth, and thus remaining "fixed" over certain points.

On the ground, equipment would include an earth station, packaged to fit into the cargo section of a passenger jet plane, light enough to be handled by two or three men, and tough enough to be housed in a tent.

The station would include its own power generator, fuel for the first emergency hours of work, and an antenna dish aimed towards the satellite.

ITU experts calculate that Geneva would be ideal for headquarters. The new UN Disaster Relief Office, the Red Cross, the WHO and ITU itself already are there. Geneva is also near the longitudinal mid-point for the disaster prone areas of the world.

Source: *Pre-Investment News*, March 1973

NEW ZEALAND – *Local Government substitute for Ombudsman*

Provisions for citizens' appeals against decisions of standing committees and council officers have been agreed to by the Wellington City Council.

Complaints are first to be heard by the town clerk and investigated by him, and where possible resolved to the council's and the citizen's satisfaction.

If an issue is not resolved this way, it will be open to referral to the appropriate standing committee.

If the committee cannot come up with an agreeable solution, the citizen can appeal to the council as a whole, or a "committee of inquiry" consisting of the mayor and two councillors.

In all circumstances, the councillors on this special committee are not to be members of the controlling committee.

The procedures are to be reviewed in six months and the acting chairman of the finance committee indicated that there could be more precise definition of how the system should work then, following a report from the town clerk.

Source: New Zealand Local Government, December 1972

Book Reviews

The Frontiers of Development Studies, by PAUL STREETEN; *Macmillan;* pp. 498; £7.50.

In this volume, Paul Streeten has brought together twenty-seven essays on development, written over the past decade. Many have been published elsewhere. They cover a diverse range but are well enough organised to read as a volume. While some of the pieces are ephemeral enough not to justify their re-publication, there is value in being able to read as a whole the recent work of a leading development economist.

As one of the author's recurring themes is the need for clarity in the exposition of economic argument, it is not surprising that the book reads well, taking up technical questions in straightforward enough terms to make the discussion readily available to the new student of the subject. The volume is a clear introduction to many of the issues which concerned development economists in the 1960s, and a record of Streeten's versatile and ingenious contributions to the debates of the period.

In the introduction the author recognises his intellectual debts to Thomas Balogh and Gunmar Myrdal. At a later point, he describes "Myrdal, Prebisch, Singer and Co." as representing an "underworld" in development thinking – an underworld of which he evidently counts himself a member. He sees himself very much as a critic of orthodoxies, be they those of neo-classical economics or Marxism, and the purveyor of unconventional views. Repeatedly his contributions take the form of stating some conventional wisdom, and ably exposing its weaknesses, showing that apparently precise reasoning often masks the real complexities of problems through misplaced aggregation, inappropriate application of concepts and failure to account for political and social factors in economic reasoning. His discussion of planning models, of capital output ratios and of a number of theories of underdevelopment exposes imprecision and spurious reasoning precisely when the argument seems most formally correct and firmly (e.g. quantitatively) based.

However, there are two basic problems with Streeton's overall approach.

Firstly, it is sometimes easier to see what Streeten is against than what he is for. This is not necessarily a serious criticism, in that the exposure of confusions and demonstrations of falsehoods is a productive activity. Yet many of those development planners who have used capital/output ratios, gross domestic product targets and the sort of simple planning models criticised, may well react by claiming that Streeten is attacking so many straw men, that these concepts are used not so much because of naive acceptance, but because of the absence of practicable alternatives. Some parts of the volume leave the impression that the only possible path for the economic policy-maker is the *ad hoc* and the intuitive. Unfortunately even more sins

have been committed under those banners than through the application of phony economic models. Streeten's defence against such a criticism must lie in those chapters in which he offers positive policy proposals, based upon a mixture of understanding institutional possibilities and application of economic reasoning.

When one looks at these discussions of institutions and policies the second doubt arises. The image of the author as an iconoclast, a member of an heterodox intellectual underworld, is at variance with the picture which emerges of him as part of the institutional establishment, a high government official during his days in Whitehall, advisor to international agencies and so forth. This is not surprising in that in reality his views are in the mainstream of western thinking on development – certainly more so than the pure forms of neo-classical economic "orthodoxy". His views would certainly be seen as part of the established conventional wisdom both by Professor Bauer and by Marxist critics.

At more than one point in this volume, Professor Streeten notes that social scientists typically fail to investigate origins of their own interests and doctrines. It is an easy task to uncover the origins of his own doctrine – they are firmly in the tradition of Western European social democracy. A commendable commitment to reform and redistribution goes alorg with a scepticism about more radical change and a taste for working within established political and bureaucratic frameworks. The result is that development studies are almost entirely discussed in relation to policy. Insofar as theoretical questions are raised it is always in relation to a policy issue. Problems of technology, measurement and institutional change are all addressed for the purpose of achieving improvements in policy. This is not to say that theory is absent, but there is little evidence of theoretical or historical speculation for its own sake.

While the concern for practical solutions may well be applauded, there is a serious cost involved, his failure to pursue awkward and provocative questions as far as he might if he were less concerned with the art of the immediately possible. New frontiers are not easily approached through the discussion of contemporary policies.

The dilemmas involved in Streeten's position are seen in the interesting chapter which evaluates the overseas development policies of the Labour Government, 1964-70. This piece, written jointly with Dudley Seers (published elsewhere, in the volume *The Labour Government's Economic Record*, ed. W. Beckerman), is quite scathing in its assessment of the Labour government's performance in this area. While the description of failure is persuasive, the explanation of causes and the lessons drawn are less convincing. The cause of Labour's failure is seen to lie in a widespread official resistance to more imaginative policies, particularly from the departments other than the Ministry of Overseas Development, and lack of will and commitment at the political level, resulting from the Labour Party's parochialism.

The impression is that Streeten, Seers and the other development economists who joined the Ministry at the outset were defeated in their hopes of

pushing U.K. development policy in imaginative new directions. Yet it is not clear to me that there was a coherent and daring alternative to the development programme formulated by the economists (here I may be unfair in that my own involvement was brief). There was certainly a desire for more aid on better terms, with greater multilateralism, but there was no grand design on the fundamental issue of who got what. A short cynical chapter in Streeten's book (Chapter 17, "A Primer for Aid Recipients") recognises the destructive character of much aid-giving, but an alternative strategy does not emerge. It may well have been that a concern to pursue the possible acted as too strong a censor.

The deeper difficulty lies in the fact that the failure of the Labour development programme to live up to the author's hopes resulted not so much from Labour Party parochialism and Whitehall shortsightedness, as from the very real conflicts between overseas development and other interests to which the government was necessarily (and in its own terms, responsibly) sensitive. Looking at the U.K. record, alongside that of the other great powers, it does not seem realistic to suppose that when conflicts arise, development objectives are likely to override strategic and commercial interest. Nor is it necessarily the case that longer term analysis will suggest a resolution of such conflicts – a way of framing policy to meet both development and other objectives (in Streeten's terms "killing two birds with one stone"). This suggests that much persuasive, sophisticated discussion of the kind offered here is less than realistic, but verges on the utopian in its hopes for new policies.

B. VAN ARKADIE

Foreign Resources and Economic Development: A Symposium on the Report of the Pearson Commission, Ed. T. J. BYRES; *Frank Cass*, 1972; index, pp. 199; £2.75.

Many people (including myself) felt that the Pearson Report embodied the conventional wisdom on aid rather than any genuinely fresh thinking. But even so, it said many things that needed saying. Unfortunately the only people likely to be convinced by its arguments were those who were already converted. If we may judge from this symposium, seven readers in particular started from prepared positions and remained there. This introduces an element of predictability to at least some of the contributions. Thus we know what Professors Bauer and Yamey think about aid; they are against it. And inevitably they find many arguments (some of them good ones) to reinforce their scepticism. But in the end, all they really demonstrate is (to quote their own words), "While foreign aid may well promote or accelerate growth, it certainly does not necessarily achieve this effect and often has not achieved it. It may have a favourable effect in countries where the conditions necessary for economic progress are present and where appropriate policies are followed". Even the most earnest supporter of foreign aid would hardly disagree.

Bauer and Yamey's objection to aid is at least partly that it places increased resources at the disposal of governments. At the other end of the political

spectrum, Byres and Griffin in their respective papers are equally sceptical about the benefits of aid, largely because it is associated with a world system of colonialism. Griffin also produces statistical evidence to suggest that levels of aid are *associated* with falls in levels of savings (although, as Michael Lipton points out, this association, if genuine, tells us nothing about the *causal* processes involved).

The difficulty which I find in Bauer and Yamey, Byres and Griffin, is the tendency to look at aid in the lump, instead of to ask "what kinds of aid, on what conditions, in what circumstances?" As Paul Streeten puts it, we need to dig beneath the aggregates. Not only is "aid" itself a rag-zag of different activities – some useful, some irrelevant and some positively disgraceful – but also the circumstances in which aid is given are an equal rag-bag, ranging from attempts to prop up oppressive regimes (where most of the "aid" funds end up in Swiss bank accounts) to circumstances where both donors and recipients are concerned with reducing poverty and promoting development. Most aid transactions fall between these two extremes. To argue, however, that because neither the motives of the donors nor the policies of the recipients conform to some ideal, aid will not help development, seems totally illegitimate. In the real world, governments are not homogeneous single-minded entities; policies and purposes pursued by one group in them may well be inconsistent with other such policies and purposes. The net result will not conform to anybody's ideal, but may well be better than doing nothing.

Michael Lipton raises the question of the allocation of aid. He believes that there is a case for selecting projects and countries where the marginal capital/output ratio (or, where foreign exchange is the critical scarcity, the marginal foreign exchange/output ratio) is low. This seems to me a recipe for reinforcing inequality, both internationally and spatially within countries. The poorest countries will probably lack economic and social infrastructure and without the expansion of such infrastructure, very little else is possible. Such infrastructure investment normally has a high marginal capital/output ratio, and there may in fact be very few projects with a low ratio. Similarly, within a country, projects with a low capital/output ratio will probably be in the more developed part of the country; peripheral areas will probably need a good deal of investment with a very low return before productive investment is even possible. It could of course be argued (and has indeed been argued) that social and economic infrastructure investment must be "justified" by some minimum rate of return. So we justify investment in health services by the extent to which they improve working ability, or improvements in education to the extent that they improve productivity. This puritanical attitude that consumption is a bad thing and only investment is a good thing, is indeed the implication of Griffin's argument. Lipton, to my mind rightly, criticises this view. But it also seems to me the implication of the criteria which he is suggesting.

The statement in this symposium which I found most remarkable comes at the end of Bauer and Yamey's contribution. "In political and public discussion support for foreign aid is now practically unanimous. The case

for aid has come to be regarded as *chose jugee*". I wonder whom Professors Bauer and Yamey actually speak to. We know that the London School of Economics is a home of lost causes, but really!

PERCY SELWYN

Developing Society and Police, edited by G. RAM REDDY and K. SESHADRI; *Osmania University, Hyderabad,* 1972; pp. 206; Rs. 30; $12.50; Sh. 90.

The need for academic and governmental co-operation in tackling India's police problems inspired the seminar on police administration which is recorded in this book. It contains the nineteen papers presented by contributors who included a judge, police officers, administrators, university teachers and a prison official, and also a brief summary of what was said by way of introduction, discussion and conclusion.

In India, as in Britain, police have received little and late recognition as a field for research. The editors would find a measure of agreement among English academics when they remark: "The researcher, like any other person, prefers to cultivate only those who reciprocate . . . Lots of mystery and secrecy surround police administration". The opening of communication between police and universities, now promisingly under way in Britain, has yet to establish itself firmly in India. The editors recognise that in some areas internal research is the more appropriate. In Britain this function is now performed centrally at the Home Office and locally by special units in individual police forces. As for externally conducted research, the editors indicate some possible fields. These are: the dual role of police as agents of law and agents of government; inter-relation between political parties and the police; need for organisational and functional changes; co-ordination between police and other public agencies; recruitment, promotion, discipline and training.

The Indian police system of today was inherited *en bloc* from yesterday's Raj. "In India the police system has not been overhauled and reorganised since 1912", writes A. Krishnaswamy Aiyangar, who goes to the root of the problem when he says that "constables are the core of the police force and obviously something will have to be done immediately to improve their conditions before high standards of police service can be hoped for". This is only too true: the quality of any police service depends on the status and ability of the men in closest contact with the public. But the mechanics of the operation of raising their status are not simple: it is not just a matter of paying the men in post more money and giving them better terms; it is a matter of getting the right men into the rank.

Idealism is never lacking in India. A Home Minister at a seminar in 1965 saw the policeman as "a social engineer, firm in his action when firmness is necessary, but with objectives in harmony with a society in which gentleness, kindness and common decency would be valid and use of force would be at a discount". But alas, force is only too prevalent. M. Venkatarangiaya's paper examines the erosion of the rule of law by large sections of the populace taking violent action to secure their aims, "however petty or trifling".

Ministers interfere in the police's discharge of police responsibilities, a negation of constitutional principle. Governmental incapacity, says this author, who is a former professor of politics, by failure to legislate in response to social change, has brought law into disrepute. However, one seeks to make the police into "social engineers", it has to be recognised that they cannot do it alone; they will always reflect the society they serve.

A judge, O. Chinappa Reddy, states a fundamental principle when he says, "successful police administration must invariably rest squarely on the sound foundation of strong public support". He, too, is an idealist: "Who will police the policeman? The Courts of course are there and so is the Legislature. Their vigilance may help. But, in my opinion, it is the policeman alone who can police the policeman. His training and tradition must protect him from himself and must protect us from him. It is, therefore, essential that every policeman must be given a liberal education as part of his training. He must be taught what democracy means; he must be made to understand how sacred basic human rights are; he must learn to respect the dignity of the human being . . ."

It is impossible in a short review to reflect the whole character of this book, with its many insights, ideas and recommendations. It has an interest for anyone interested in the science and art of policing. It is a good augury that at a time of turbulence and trouble so many people of goodwill could come together in India and examine the larger problems confronting their police. The task before the authorities is immense. It is no less than to transform a police system imposed long ago by a colonial government into a service which the people of India can recognise as an emanation of their own need. This was widely recognised by the participants in the seminar. Its accomplishment will demand both of the nation and the states long-term policies and long-term re-deployment of scarce resources.

PHILIP JOHN STEAD

Nyerere of Tanzania, by WILLIAM EDGETT SMITH; *Victor Gollancz;* pp. 207; £2.50.

The book covers the growth of the nationalist movement, the emergence of Nyerere as its leader, and the first ten years of independence. Mr. Smith for the most part stands back and lets others express their views. He has collected a large body of comment covering the main events of the period and on some of them, such as the revolution in Zanzibar and the creation of the United Republic of Tanzania, he has been particularly successful in weaving these into a full and satisfying account. His treatment of the story of the expulsion of Gordon and Carlucci shows how skilfully he is able to find his way through the tangle of conjecture and misunderstanding and get at the truth. He is remarkably dispassionate in his treatment of this incident and ready to accept what happened at face value. But he does hint at the possibility that the misinterpretation was deliberate and that there might have been some who preferred to see hostility where the reverse was the case. His unwillingness to explore possible motives is even more noteworthy in his treatment of the strange story of the forged papers which

conjured up the wild imaginings of the American plot to overthrow the Tanzanian Government in 1965. He does make some attempt to apportion responsibility between Kambona and Nyerere but one might have hoped that, with the special sources open to him, he could have come to a more positive conclusion. But even more, one might have hoped that he would have analysed the significance of the readiness of the Tanzanian Government to give credence to a fabrication of this kind and to give wide publicity to it without waiting for verification. Who was behind this forgery and what was its purpose? Why was it so readily believed and is the explanation that Kambona planned it from the outset, perhaps at the behest of some outside power interested in undermining the American position? Could there be a link here with the Gordon-Carlucci affair?

Again, while the Arusha Declaration and the new policies which flowed from it are given the importance they deserve, could not some of the space devoted to the admittedly entertaining account of Nyerere's long walk to Mwanza have been given to an assessment of the social and economic consequences of these policies? They are perhaps the most significant departure from the established pattern of economic development followed in other countries and may have lessons for them. Are they likely in practice to produce economic growth from the village upwards and to spread new wealth more evenly throughout the social structure or will they lead to frustration and stagnation? Some indication of the author's views, or even of those of other observers, would have been of value.

The arguments in favour of a one party system and its democratic advantages in the special circumstances of Tanzania are well put; but perhaps Nyerere's own determination to be a democratic head of state and his responsiveness to opinion in the National Executive Committee of TANU and in the regions might have been brought out more clearly. Some of the actions of his government can best be understood against this background. Democracy inevitably has its drawbacks as well as its virtues in a country passing through a social and cultural revolution.

Nyerere's concern over the racial issues of southern Africa and his readiness to sacrifice Tanzania's own immediate interests for his stand on the Rhodesia question are dealt with briefly but with understanding. However, his tendency to involve Tanzania in the affairs of other countries (witness his support for the rebellion in the Congo in 1965) deserves more attention. Some of Tanzania's present embarrassments may stem from this cause. His relations with China are given fuller treatment, no doubt with American readers in mind. Nyerere's admiration for Chinese frugality and hard work and his conviction that he can take aid from them without greater involvement than with the West, are clearly brought out. On one of the rare occasions when Mr. Smith ventures a view of his own he writes:

> "Presumably the Chinese are calculating that the Western nations will continue to withdraw their aid and abdicate their influence; that the white countries will draw together when the crisis comes in southern Africa, as it surely will; and that the countless individual relationships

that bind the men and institutions of Tanzania and its neighbours with those of Britain and, to a lesser extent, America will not survive beyond the next twenty or thirty years. And indeed, if the western nations continue to deal half-heartedly and unresponsively with the problems of African development, there may be a terrible inevitability about such a calculation."

This seems to me to be a sound assessment and I wish he had aired his views more often.

Mr. Smith has cast himself in the role of a Boswell rather than of an historian or biographer, and as such he has produced a lively and pleasing picture of Nyerere. It shows him as a man of principle, able to thrust aside long established attitudes and conceptions and to evolve new approaches to problems which he then has the gift to expound with such cogency that general support is won for them. His principles may sometimes run counter to what is expedient but a head of government who insists on following policies based firmly on principle is likely to stand out in the history of our times as a man to be admired.

Altogether a book to be read, both for the lively picture of an African statesman and for the account of a period of African history of special significance.

ROBERT FOWLER

Local Government Finance in Nigeria, edited by ADEBAYO ADEDEJI and L. ROWLAND, *University of Ife Press*; pp. 333; £3.50, $8.95.

Professor Adedeji, in this instance ably partnered by the United Nations Adviser on Local Government, Mr. Rowland, presents the reviewer with yet another of the publications which flow steadily, indeed remorselessly, from the Institute of Administration at Ife, either under their own imprint or that of Hutchinson. It is not, unfortunately, the easiest of their offerings to review, being in effect a bound volume of the background papers, summary of proceedings and conclusions and recommendations of the Third National Conference on Local Government, held at Benin City in December 1970. Perhaps the most significant thing about the Conference is that it took place at all, and was the third of a carefully planned series in which the subject matter was deliberately narrowed down from local government at large in 1968 to research and training in 1969 and to finance in 1970. This annual sharing of experience by senior civil servants and academics (there being currently no politicians in Nigeria) has shown that there are minds at work in the Institute prepared to take a long view and to build patiently, and has been an encouragement to those who are interested in the good government of Nigeria.

To this extent nothing could be better. Alas, when one examines the contents of the book one is less encouraged, as is not unusual in contemplating local government in Nigeria. Problems are penetratingly analysed but their solution is not apparent; policies are adumbrated but no-one could possibly call them realistic; the recommendations of the First and Second Conferences are reviewed but it is noted that nothing perceptible has occurred as a result of them.

A book of this kind, being a compendium rather than an exposition, is apt to leave the reviewer with scattered impressions rather than with a theme on which to grip. Three such impressions remain with the present reviewer.

First, there is the book's value for reference. The background papers, which form more than two-thirds of the whole and which include a number of distinguished contributions by Mr. Rowland, probably form the best available text-book on current problems and practice.

Second, an illuminating preface, called an "overview", by Professor Adedeji. His theme is the vicious circle of poverty as it affects local government – familiar enough in itself, but here illuminated from statistical sources. The value of his analysis is possibly that it reminds us that local government in Nigeria (or anywhere else) is not inherently fallible, but is simply as good or as bad as governments choose to make it. In Nigeria there are human and material resources sufficient for a modestly efficient central or local administration, but not for both – especially since the inauguration of the States.

For the third impression, gained at a number of points in the book, is of the inhibiting effect on local government as hitherto conceived of twelve State Governments, since twelve civil services drain off more talent and material resources than four. This is strikingly apparent in the North, for it was here that the native authorities, like their counterparts in Britain, preceded central government in most matters affecting the welfare of the ordinary people; here also that to be a District Head or N.A. official was more prestigious than to be a civil servant. But with the Region divided into States, and the former N.As. sub-divided into areas, the effectiveness and prestige of northern local government has been reduced. This fact is apparent in a rather different context in the background papers on Development Finance, and especially in a notable paper by Mahmud Tukur, who deals among other things with the fate of the former Native Authorities Loans Authority (NALA), and makes clear that although the States are political realities only some conjunction of States, or possibly their supersession for this particular purpose by a Federal Loans Board, would constitute reality for purposes of capital development.

Other impressions might remain more vividly in the minds of other reviewers, for the book is a quarry where most readers could find what happens to interest them, and by being selective could probably find their own prejudices confirmed. It is a pity that time does not stand still for the two years or so that it seems to take to get a substantial book into circulation. Fortunately there has been no major cataclysm since December 1970; fortunately, also, most of the discussion is of basic and permanent themes; but probably no-one writing in the United Kingdom could say with confidence how accurate the detail may be at this distance of time.

R. E. WRAITH

Aid and Liberation: A Socialist Study of Aid Politics, by JUDITH HART; *Gollancz, London,* 1973; pp. 287; £3.80.

This is a very useful book, in three different dimensions.

First, it is a general review of aid policies in the First Development Decade and an account of the deep "aid weariness" (p. 222) which set in as a result of "the disastrous aid record of the 'sixties". The account is at the level of the general reader rather than of the specialist, and it may contain technical faults. But it is plain, readable and balanced, and rests both on the published documents and on Mrs. Hart's experience as Minister of Overseas Development from 1969 to 1970.

Secondly, it contains throughout (and particularly in the section on British Aid (pp. 179-187)) the reflections of an able politician who has had quite a wide range of experience in office on the dilemmas of aid administration in Whitehall, of aid politics in the British setting. When Overseas Development was set up as a separate Ministry, in the days of the late Sir Andrew Cohen and his first Minister, Barbara Castle, the founders fought a good fight and secured a reasonably wide field of action. But (p. 187) the Ministry lacked a power base in Whitehall.

> "A power base depends upon one of two factors. Either the minister must be a person of weight and standing in the Cabinet itself; or other ministries must be closely concerned in what it does from the point of view of their own interests. They must be sufficiently involved either to support it or oppose it with some degree of passion. Apart from the traditional struggle of any spending department with the Treasury, ODM was an isolated ministry. Nobody cared very much what it did. It offended no one, and aroused neither enmities nor affection in Whitehall. It played very much of a lone game.
>
> The functions and responsibilities of overseas aid and development are unlikely in the future to impinge greatly upon most home departments. Nor does it have a base of electoral popularity. It follows that its strength or weakness will be largely determined by its Minister."

The main points of reference are the Ministries concerned with balance of payments, with trade and with external relations; at present the Treasury, the Department of Trade and Industry and the Foreign and Commonwealth office. Insofar as aid business is handled between separate departments coordination will be difficult and the Aid Ministry will be by far the weakest of the four. But if aid is attached even loosely to another Department, as the Overseas Development Administration is now attached to the F.C.O., aid policy will necessarily be subordinated to some other branch of policy and will be judged by criteria which do not give absolute priority to consideration of what is best for the recipients of aid.

These limitations Mrs. Hart accepts ruefully as facts of the situation.

Finally, the author joins battle with other socialists about the socialist principles of aid. Her title seems to reflect the title of *Aid as Imperialism* which was published for Teresa Hayter in 1971 and reflects the latter's

experience with the O.D.I. from 1963 to 1968. Miss Hayter's book deals with the experience of the 1960's during which those most closely concerned were gradually infected with "aid weariness", and it helped to spread that infection to a wider public. In particular, there were changes on the Left. At the start of the 1960's the Left was virtually unanimous about the priorities for aid to poor countries. By the end of the decade the notion of "aid as imperialism" had been systematised into a radical theory that aid was useless, and perhaps positively harmful, if given within the framework of world capitalism. The proper task was not to give aid to development, but to foment and aid revolution.

Mrs. Hart's view is more mature. She insists on socialist consistency in aid, for instance in the way in which a socialist government should relate its aid policy to public and private sectors, and her stance is still firmly on the left. But she is prepared to agree on the evidence of the facts to which she had access as Minister that aid policies can be and are being improved, especially as regards multilateral aid. In fact, she takes Robert McNamara of the World Bank very seriously as an honest and able policy-maker and administrator, and does not write him off as the Monster of the Pentagon, as the Left is apt to do.

Furthermore, though she insists on the fundamental character of socialist principle, she is prepared to recommend a pragmatic and "incremental" approach to aid policy. The principle of the equality of men is sacred: but to promote it one must in office be prepared to make small gains and small compromises, knowing that to contrive aid at all is to swim against the tide of electoral politics at home in the U.K., and even more in the U.S.A. whose aid is so much more important.

At the end of the book (p. 280) she calls both for "passionate concern" and for "a hard political understanding".

> "There are those – both in the rich world and the Third World – who think that to regard these issues with passion is a strange but admirable eccentricity. But we are the political realists. We are concerned with the human race, and with tomorrow's world."
> Surely this is the truth of the matter?

W. J. M. MACKENZIE

Colonialism, Development and Independence – The case of the Melanesian islands in the South Pacific, by H. BROOKFIELD; *Cambridge University Press;* appendix, Ref. list; index; pp. 226; £4.80.

In the preface the author, a geographer, concedes: "I range – dangerously – over a number of disciplines in a manner that is certain to earn me criticism". Within his own discipline this book will doubtless become prescribed reading but, since it is his apparent intention to go beyond that and to appeal to a wider public, then my first comment must be that he has made it at times heavy going for laymen like myself with his excessive reliance on the professional idiom of the social scientist.

Nevertheless, for the non-professional who survives the indoctrination of the first chapter, the book has an absorbing theme – the interplay of the forces of so-called "colonialism" and "independence" from past to present and projecting into the future as the conventional colonial situation gives way to other forms of relationship. As one would expect from Professor Brookfield, great erudition is shown in the wide range of comparative material and the able analyses of conditions in the segment of the Third World about which he writes.

The territories covered by him are the vast land to the North of Australia partitioned between West Irian and Papua/New Guinea (where the author did most of his field work), the Solomon Islands, New Hebrides and New Caledonia – and finally the Dominion of Fiji. The book's chapters are equally divided between the century and a half preceding the Second World War – a natural watershed – and the post-War years, which is a fair indication of the relative weighting given to current affairs.

I confess I find the book uneven, at its best in New Guinea, at its weakest in Fiji. This may of course reflect my own closer experience of the latter: the condensed treatment of an individual country, inevitable in a study of this nature involving six different countries, leads to generalisations that strain the facts and disturb the reader with particular knowledge of a particular country. But it is not only that. The author lumps his islands together under the term MELANESIA and attempts to forestall objection by explaining why he has included Fiji. For the purposes of this exercise I remain unconvinced. He would have been well advised either to have stopped short of Fiji or, since his aim is "to extract the meaning of the story rather than present it in exhaustive detail", to have extended the scope of his study across the South Pacific and thereby placed the Dominion in its proper perspective.

Ironically enough, the map at pages 2 and 3 does just that – it purports to show MELANESIA and in addition to the above-mentioned territories includes Nauru, the Gilbert and Ellice Islands, Western Samoa and Tonga. Three out of these four countries have become independent within the last eleven years and would have added considerably to the variety and value of the case material. Furthermore, to understand fully the position of Fiji, one must appreciate that her associations are with her *Eastern* rather than her Western neighbours.

To take one example, Professor Brookfield is as much concerned with efforts to get away from the toils of economic colonialism as with the achievement of political independence. Commendably surmounting the hurdles of publishing deadlines, he has brought his political study right up to date with the results of the 1972 Fiji Election; yet in the economic field he has failed to catch up with regional developments in which Fiji has taken an influential role such as the Pacific Islands Producers' Association (members: Fiji, Western Samoa, Tonga, Niue, the Cook Islands and the Gilbert and Ellice Islands) or, more significant still, the South Pacific Forum (members: Fiji, Western Samoa, Tonga, the Cook Islands and Nauru in association

with Australia and New Zealand). The latter organisation has now decided to set up in Suva its own bureau for economic co-operation. To quote from the official communiqué: "The Forum recognised that a prime trade objective of the region was to endeavour to change the pattern whereby the territories, previously dependent, had supplied raw materials to metropolitan countries but were unable to manufacture many of the goods they required". This is particularly relevant to Professor Brookfield's theme. Indeed the effects have been felt right across on the other side of the Western Pacific where the Chief Minister of Papua/New Guinea, recognising the significance of the Forum, has applied to join it.

However, I would not wish my specialised interest to detract from what is clearly an important contribution to South Pacific studies, in particular the final chapters on the problems of nation building. Two hundred years ago James Cook and his contemporaries were probing into the region, bestowing place-names that continue to link our own islands and these far off groups. Though we now seem to be celebrating the Cook bicentenary by disengaging ourselves in as short a time as possible from our direct Pacific responsibilities, aid and trade go on and we still have a duty to keep ourselves informed. This book is eminently suited to that purpose.

A. C. REID

Government through Consultation: Advisory Committees in Indian Government, by SHRIRAM MAHESHWARI; *The Indian Institute of Public Administration, New Delhi,* 1972; pp. XX, 380; £3.00.

Dr. Maheshwari's work is a useful introduction to the functions and significance of the advisory committees to the Indian government. These committees, of which there were more than 500 in 1962, are defined as "consisting either exclusively or partially of persons not on the payroll of the Central Government". *Ad hoc* bodies are excluded. Purely consultative committees form 71 per cent of the total, and the remainder are classified as expert committees, committees with delegated executive powers, territorial committees (for centrally-administered areas such as Delhi), zonal councils, and parliamentary advisory committees. Although it might seem that the categories have little in common, the committees, with the partial exception of the territorial committees and the expert committees, contribute to the participation in government by non-officials and to the flow of information to the administration. An additional function, of particular importance in India, is to achieve a degree of uniformity and co-ordination between the Central and the State governments. Dr. Maheshwari brings this point out well in his discussion of the consultative committees and the zonal councils.

In his general chapters Dr. Maheshwari makes some perceptive comments on the origins of advisory committees and their relationship to the government. He shows how they can be used as a sop to satisfy demands for more positive action and explains their tendency to multiply without good effect. His conclusion is that advisory committees are potentially of great importance to the articulation of a democratic system, but that in India they have still to reach their full capacity. The detailed accounts of each type of committee

are not, however, as interesting. Although a number of case studies are given, they are somewhat pedestrian in approach and are based primarily on material from the 1950s. There are only impressionistic comments on the actual influence of advisory committees on the policy-making process.

DAVID TAYLOR

Tribes and their Development – A Study of Two Tribal Development Blocks in Orissa, by N. PATNAIK; *National Institute of Community Development, Hyderabad,* 1972; pp. 117; Rs. 15.00.

This book is the report of research into the impact of development policies on two areas of Orissa State, India. The study was, in intention, comparative but the areas proved to be so different that the report claims to be contrastive rather than comparative.

The two areas studied are "special multi-purpose tribal blocks" which came into existence in 1956-7. The objectives of the study are stated as being (i) to ascertain the income and expenditure patterns of the local administration over three years; (ii) to study in detail three development programmes – road communications, provision of drinking water wells and agricultral improvement; and (iii) to investigate the degree of involvement of the tribals in the process of political modernisation. The methods used were mainly observational, but some more formal research techniques were employed. The author lived for some months in each area.

The main body of the book is taken up with descriptions and analyses of the situation in each area. For the first, the assistance of an anthropologist was enlisted and a picture of everyday life in the remote villages emerges, with the impact of the development programmes in their traditional way of life clearly painted up. The second area is treated very differently, ostensibly because its already greater degree of development and communication precluded a similar anthropological approach. This is a pity as the picture of this area lacks the intimate detail of the former, and the impact of policies on everyday life cannot be as clearly discerned.

It is true that the two areas do not seem to be comparable in the light of information given, but one wonders whether this is due, not only to factors inherent in the situation, but also to the fact that the author appears to have had different objectives in the two areas under consideration. In the first, assisted by an anthropologist, he is concerned with cultural factors in socio-economic change, but in the second his main interest is in analysis of political change. It seems self-evident that there must have been political change in the first area and socio-economic implications of political change in the second area but these are not adequately discussed, and valuable opportunities for making comparisons are thereby lost.

A major difficulty with this study lies in a disconcerting vagueness of definitions. Admittedly, much of the problem springs from the fact that it is written by an Indian for Indians, who, presumably, understand the terms ends, and for whom, therefore, no glossary is needed. But what, for instance,

is a tribe in the sense used in the title of this book? The term is obviously used in a very specific sense that requires explanation.

In view of the brevity of the discussion of relevant factors, the conclusions and recommendations do not seem to carry very much weight, except, perhaps, in a specifically local sense. However, as plea for more analysis of socio-economic as well as political factors before administrative action is taken, the work is undoubtedly of great interest.

One of the most interesting areas of discussion is that of élite formation and exploitation – a theme which runs through the whole book and is apparent in different forms in each area. Strongly legitimated feudal hierarchies, caste situations, economic exploitation by powerful commercial élites and the emergence of new élites in the modernisation context are all described. This aspect of the work could form the basis for a useful case study of élite activity in the context of social change.

There is a great need for case study material of this kind, investigating the inter relationships of variables in the development process. In this respect, the present work has considerable interest but goes only far enough to be tantalising! So much of importance to those concerned with the modernisation process is remote, traditional areas are touched on, but not developed in sufficient detail. Perhaps the author will, in the future, look more deeply into the factors he has selected so that his work will have wider relevance than administrative reforms in one area of one country.

C. F. SWAISLAND

A Third Force for the Third World – Report of a Working Party; *Overseas Development Institute*, 1972; pp. 19; 50p.

Sponsored jointly by Christian Aid and the Catholic Fund for Overseas Development, a working group of distinguished specialists examined the channels for investment of Church Trust Funds in economic development overseas*. As they point out the report deals with one narrow facet of aid to developing countries – that relating to "investments and loans made so as to secure appropriate return for trust funds whose income is required for essential church purposes and whose capital must be safeguarded in real terms". They consider a suitable scheme could be evolved and once established so adapted as to assist over the channeling of funds to projects – rural development, public works, low cost housing, thereby providing a measure of alleviation to the difficult sectors of poverty and unemployment "for which trust funds in the main would not be available".

The report points out that a number of channels are already available:

(a) The World Bank and its affiliated organisations,

(b) the regional banks established in the Third World,

(c) such international private-enterprise institutions operating in the Third World as the Private Investment Co. for Asia,

(d) Institutions such as CDC and CDFC,

(e) national development corporations and banks in developing countries,

(f) shares or debentures of companies quoted on stock exchanges and the public loans of ldcs likewise quoted, and

(g) similarly the stock quoted on local ldc stock markets.

The possibilities under each category are discussed and the conclusion reached that the ways effectively open to individual or trustee investment are limited, nonetheless wide publicity for the facilities available is recommended. It is suggested that a managing body or forum be established (drawn, it is assumed from leading members of the UK business and financial community), to advise on ways and means for the investment of charitable funds in the Third World – such advice to be provided free or at cost.

The Working Group go further, however, and recommend that consideration be given to the establishment of a new institution – "a trust for the specific purpose of enabling charitable and other trust funds to invest in Third World Development on a greater scale than hitherto . . . geared to meeting the requirements of trustees of charitable funds" who would expect a normal market return on their investment.

The Working Party believes they have conceived a potentially worthwhile initiative. "By keeping themselves apart from (though often in partnership with) established government and private investment institutions in developed countries, church investors could pioneer the use of investment money with a moral purpose and thus become a third force in the Third World. Maybe a touch of Victorian philosophy creeps in here: But the sentiments are worthy and the report it is greatly to be hoped will lead to further and constructive action.

P.H.J.

*The article by Dr. E. F. Schumacher and George McRobie in Vol. III, No. 2 of this Journal, is also relevant to the possible role of voluntary agencies overseas.—Ed.

Book Notes

A Guide to Project Appraisal in Developing Countries; FOREIGN & COMMONWEALTH OFFICE OVERSEAS DEVELOPMENT ADMINISTRATION; *HMSO;* pp. 126; £1.50.

The purpose of this guide is to provide a practical basis for appraising projects financed by the public sector and for screening private sector projects which are subject to public sector approval. Its character is operational rather than theoretical. The methodology as developed in the guide represents a practical means of applying the type of analytical framework proposed by the OECD *Manual of Industrial Project Analysis in Developing Countries*, Vol. II (Social Cost-Benefit Analysis) written by I. M. D. Little and J. A. Mirrlees. This analytical framework is of general application but was designed particularly for use in developing economies.

It should be emphasised that although in detail the approach of the guide can be daunting, the fundamental principles are simple and, indeed, of long standing. Any attempt to apply the guide in its entirety is almost certainly foredoomed to failure. It is not intended to be a set of rigid rules for the user but a general approach which can, and must, be applied with discretion and judgement in practice. This guide pays particular attention to three points in assessing projects; the use of international prices and not local domestic prices; the use of a shadow wage rate for labour and the use in all calculations of the returns on alternative investments of a single rate of discount, chosen to measure the opportunity cost of capital.

Underdevelopment & Development – the Third World Today, Ed. HENRY BERNSTEIN; *Penguin Books;* index; pp. 384; £1.00.

This well-produced volume contains 21 readings drawn from material published between 1960 and 1971: 8 excerpts are of a general nature, 5 relate to Latin America and the Caribbean, 3 to Africa, 2 to India, 1 each to Iran, Java/Japan and China. The selections are not confined to economics; a fair measure of attention is given to sociology and political science. While one has reservations about "readings", however carefully chosen, as a source of knowledge for students, with the danger of the context being overlooked and of the doubtful relevance of outdated material, provided the student is directed to further fuller reference to the sources this book should prove useful as an introduction to those beginning their "development studies".

The Dynamics of Indian Political Factions, a Study of District Councils in the State of Maharashtra, by MARY C. CALLAS; *Cambridge Uuiversity Press;* appendices, notes, bibliography, index; pp. 297; £6.50.

The development of the *Panchayati Raj* system of democratic local government has provided Indian local authorities with important functions and responsibilities for local development. They have acquired "considerable political weight as relatively independent dispensers of patronage". In Maharashtra State the subject of Dr. Callas' study, direct popular elections to the *Zilla Parishad* (district Council) on a party basis were introduced by the State government, and the element of political competition within these authorities become an important facet of State politics as a whole since new power bases in rural areas can only be ignored at their peril by leading State politicians.

Dr. Callas examines the causes for a politician to "rebel" against his party and seeks to show how far such "rebellion" can be predicted by an analysis of the individual's own circumstances – personal and environmental. She concludes that Indian politicians are motivated by ideological preferences where these are inter-linked with consideration of personal interest. She finds that where co-operative based groups in the *Zilla Parishad* intrude into the economic arena of entrepreneurs then conflict arises. Where co-operatives are strong and well organised in an agriculturally

prosperous area, then such groups with their political weight can have considerable effect, with pro- and anti-co-op feelings causing political conflict at local level. Should the co-operative movement capture the *Zilla Parishad* the State government could well be faced with a policy making dilemma – back or retreat from support for co-operatives, curb or close the local authorities. In the long term, of course, the control of the State could fall to those who control rural local government, but the rapidity of urban growth could well preclude this.

The High Price of Principles – Kaunda and the White South, by RICHARD HALL; *Penguin African Library;* maps and index; pp. 287; 50p.

Richard Hall is a journalist with considerable Zambian/Northern Rhodesian experience. He writes with understanding and sympathy of the problems faced by Dr. Kaunda who inherited a minerally-prosperous but sadly ill-educated country, with cash reserves the envy no doubt of most African States, only, through no fault of his own, soon to have Rhodesian UDI present him with economic and political difficulties which he could not possibly resolve on his own.

The author tells the story well of how the Tan-Zam railway has come to being built, how Zambia is becoming a "one-party participating democracy".

A useful addition to an Africana library.

Population Growth Control in Kenya, by LARS BONDESTAM; *The Scandinavian Institute of African Affairs, Uppsala, Sweden;* with bibliography and appendix; pp. 56.

We are told that the author is a demographer who has been working in Ethiopia, but the extent of his practical research in Kenya is not apparent. Unfortunately his monograph is largely filled with somewhat snide criticism of expatriate advisers and current Kenyan Government policies. While one can regard seriously the author's criticism of demographic matters since this is his field of expertise, it is less easy to accept the self-assurance with which he writes about land utilisation, urbanisation and unemployment, matters one feels about which his Kenya knowledge may be fairly limited. His conclusion that Kenya "has no room for a policy which aims at decreasing the growth of its main asset in the development process – its people" could easily receive popular acclaim in a rural peasant society, but many would regard as irresponsible the advocacy of *laissez-faire* in a land where the population growth rate has topped the 3 per cent level. Of course population control of itself does not generate economic prosperity, but a reduction in population growth rate can certainly reduce the magnitude of the task of improving the lot of the under-privileged. The difference between the growth of GNP and the growth of *per capita* income in DDI was clear enough. For a sensible and balanced approach to population policy in Kenya the reader would do well to look at the recent ILO Mission Report*, which recommends a national family planning programme as an integral part of Kenya's efforts towards social and economic development.

Tanzania – a Profile, by JOHN HATCH; *Pall Mall Press,* 1972; index; pp. 214; £2.75.

This pleasant, lightly written volume, is very properly described as a "profile". John Hatch, whose own visit to Dar es Salaam just as TANU was emerging out of the moribund old African Association, was not without its effect on the party's formulative stage, is understandably sympathetic towards the philosophy of self-reliance and an egalitarian society on which Dr. Nyerere's policies are based.

While the author's spectacles are tinted he does not overlook some of the problems resulting from the over-zealous application of the Arusha Declaration. He is less than fair in his brief summary of the British Trusteeship. The views of an unnamed director

*Vide Ch. 8, *Employment, Incomes & Equality* (ILO, Geneva).

of Education on inter-racial schools and those of the admirable Charles Dundas on indirect rule in Kenya should not be regarded as *obiter dicta* in respect of British policy in Tanganyika. Nor were the excellent Makerere-trained doctors mere "Medical Assistants". Swynnerton pere's operations against the tsetse, Dr. Maclean's against sleeping sickness, Dr. Wheate's against leprosy (pre-war post-independent), Dr. Davies' against TB are, for example, unmentioned, while references to the expansion of African tobacco, cotton and coffee growing (beyond Kilimanjaro) could be taken to relate almost solely to the post-independence era. Until CD & W was invented, dependencies had to balance their budgets and meet all expenditure – it is with the doctrine not the administration that blame lies.

Sir William MacGregor, by R. B. JOYCE, *Oxford University Press;* maps, notes, bibliography, index; pp. 484; £8.75.

Here is an interesting story told none too well, in a rambling sort of way – the author is diffuse at every opportunity and infuriatingly fails to provide the reader with any clear chronology of his hero's remarkable career. Remarkable it was indeed. MacGregor is one of a number of exceptions to the mistaken but widely held belief that Colonial service top jobs were the preserve of administrators with Public School and Oxbridge backgrounds. Here was a man who was brought up in a humble croft, reached grammar school at 19, then proceeding to qualify as a doctor through exacting schools of medicine in Scotland.

Doctor in the Seychelles; thence to Fiji as Chief Medical Officer and where he was responsible for the beginnings of the notable Central Medical School at Suva; on to New Guinea for a decade as administrator; next to Africa as Governor of Lagos at the turn of the century; then to a cooler clime as Governor of Newfoundland and finally to Queensland as Governor until his retirement in 1914.

A grumpy, touchy, tetchy, restless character, MacGregor seems to have been, difficult with colleagues and querulous at delays in his own career. But, beyond doubt a capable competent doctor-administrator who must have had fire in his belly to have got so far so soon and to have held to the top so long – clearly he must have possessed such qualities of leadership and administrative skill as to offset even with his Whitehall masters, the clashes and conflicts which he evoked from time to time in the differing countries in which he served.

He well deserved a biography. A shorter more succinct one, costing less, would have served better.

The Influence of the United States on Canadian Development, Ed. RICHARD A. PRESTON; *Duke University Press, Durham, NC;* index; pp. 269; $7.75.

While the theme of this admirably-produced volume does not really lie within the scope of this Journal, mention must be made of yet another extension to our knowledge of the British Commonwealth for which Duke University is responsible. Six historians, a sociologist, two political scientists, an English language and a romance language academic, a sociologist and a planner provide an introductory chapter and eleven case studies covering diverse aspects of the Canadian/United States relationship. The scholarship contained provides illumination and entertainment – including an intriguing essay on "Salmagundi in Canada".

Language, Psychology and Culture – Essays, by WALLACE E. LAMBERT – selected and introduced by ANWAR S. DIL; *Stanford University Press, USA; Oxford University Press, England;* bibliography; pp. 362; £5.00.

Professor Lambeert is described as a leading authority on psycholinguistics and bi-lingualism. The essays here were selected for a series on language science and national development, sponsored by the linguistic Research Group of Pakistan. Professor Lambert is primarily a psychologist and does not in fact claim to be a linguist – rather someone with a great interest in language. He writes on bi-lingualism

from his own bi-lingual home background (his wife is French) and to many in an ever more internationalised world, with English and French jointly providing a universally important language group – in every walk of life, this book should provide stimulating and thought-provoking reading.

The Management of Britain's External Relations, ROBERT BOARDMAN and A. J. R. GROOM (Eds.); *Macmillan, London,* 1973; notes, bibliography, index, pp. 362; £5.95.

The editors provide an introduction and a postcript, and a dozen mostly academic contributors each provide a chapter on a particular facet of the British Foreign Office. While the currency of the chapters which are not "readings" but have been specially written, is welcome, by and large the contributions make no more than a rather lightweight introduction for students of British Foreign affairs.

Art in Pakistan – Early Years, by JALALUDDIN AHMED; *Routledge and Kegan Paul, London,* 1973; introduction and 72 colour plates; £4.00.

Jalaluddin Ahmed has selected works from some 40 Pakistan painters whom he introduces in a prologue to the plates. The publishers are to be congratulated on the excellence of the reproductions and UNESCO for making this new edition possible for a wider circulation. The painting skills of modern Pakistan artists have evolved from a deep cultural background – with Sixteenth Century heritage akin to the Renaissance. As in most of the newly independent countries few painters in Pakistan can make an adequate living as professionals without the rewards of commercial art. Here at any rate is an excellent bargain for those interested in modern painting and in its development in a new Asian country.

Tile – Mosaics of the Lahore Fort, by J. PH. VOGEL, Edited by Sir JOHN MARSHALL; *Pakistan Publications, Karachi; Routledge = Kegan Paul, London,* 1973; 55 pages of text, appendices, index, plans and some 100 pages of coloured plates; £5.50.

A dozen coloured plates have been added in this new edition of "Tile-Mosaics of Lahore Fort", first published in 1920 and long since out of print, and the publishers are to be congratulated on their admirable workmanship, providing nearly a hundred well-reproduced coloured plates following a largely explanatory text which is very well presented.

The tile-work at Lahore was mainly carried out in the Seventeenth Century and to the many who are interested in Asian pictorial art and craftsmanship this volume will provide a great deal of pleasure at a very modest cost.

Printed in England for HER MAJESTY'S STATIONERY OFFICE
by Adams & Sons (Printers) Ltd., East Street, Hereford.
Dd 507027 K16 9/73